



INTERNATIONAL TELECOMMUNICATION UNION

ITU-T

TELECOMMUNICATION
STANDARDIZATION SECTOR
OF ITU

WORLD TELECOMMUNICATION STANDARDIZATION
ASSEMBLY

Dubai, 20-29 November 2012

RECOMMENDATION ITU-T A.5 – Generic procedures for including references to documents of other organizations in ITU-T Recommendations

CAUTION !

PREPUBLISHED RECOMMENDATION

This prepublication is an unedited version of a recently approved ITU-T Recommendation. It will be replaced by the published version after editing. Therefore, there will be differences between this prepublication and the published version.

FOREWORD

The International Telecommunication Union (ITU) is the United Nations specialized agency in the field of telecommunications, information and communication technologies (ICTs). The ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector (ITU-T) is a permanent organ of ITU. ITU-T is responsible for studying technical, operating and tariff questions and issuing Recommendations on them with a view to standardizing telecommunications on a worldwide basis.

The World Telecommunication Standardization Assembly (WTSA), which meets every four years, establishes the topics for study by the ITU-T study groups which, in turn, produce Recommendations on these topics.

The approval of ITU-T Recommendations is covered by the procedure laid down in WTSA Resolution 1.

In some areas of information technology which fall within ITU-T's purview, the necessary standards are prepared on a collaborative basis with ISO and IEC.

NOTE

In this Recommendation, the expression "Administration" is used for conciseness to indicate both a telecommunication administration and a recognized operating agency.

Compliance with this Recommendation is voluntary. However, the Recommendation may contain certain mandatory provisions (to ensure, e.g., interoperability or applicability) and compliance with the Recommendation is achieved when all of these mandatory provisions are met. The words "shall" or some other obligatory language such as "must" and the negative equivalents are used to express requirements. The use of such words does not suggest that compliance with the Recommendation is required of any party.

INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY RIGHTS

ITU draws attention to the possibility that the practice or implementation of this Recommendation may involve the use of a claimed Intellectual Property Right. ITU takes no position concerning the evidence, validity or applicability of claimed Intellectual Property Rights, whether asserted by ITU members or others outside of the Recommendation development process.

As of the date of approval of this Recommendation, ITU [had/had not] received notice of intellectual property, protected by patents, which may be required to implement this Recommendation. However, implementers are cautioned that this may not represent the latest information and are therefore strongly urged to consult the TSB patent database at <http://www.itu.int/ITU-T/ipr/>.

© ITU 2012

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, by any means whatsoever, without the prior written permission of ITU.

RECOMMENDATION ITU-T A.5

Generic procedures for including references to documents of other organizations in ITU-T Recommendations

(1998; 2000; 2001; 2012)

1 Scope

This Recommendation provides generic procedures for referencing the documents of other organizations in ITU-T Recommendations. This clause outlines the Scope, clauses 2 and 3 describe the procedures in detail. Appendix I provides the format for documenting a study group or working party decision with respect to making the reference. Specific information regarding organizations can be found on the ITU-T website.

NOTE – These generic procedures do not apply to references to standards produced by ISO and IEC. The long-standing ability to make such references continues unchanged.

2 Generic procedures for including references to documents of other organizations in ITU-T Recommendations

2.1 A member of an ITU-T study group identifies the need to make a specific reference (either normative or non-normative) to a document from another organization (referred to as the "referenced organization") within a specific draft Recommendation. It is preferred that, rather than making reference to an entire document from an outside organization, reference be made to only the specific section(s) concerned.

Two types of reference are considered in this Recommendation:

- i) **Normative reference** – The whole or parts of a document to which it is necessary to conform in order to claim compliance to the Recommendation containing the reference.
- ii) **Non-normative reference** – The whole or parts of a document where the referenced document has been used as supplementary information in the preparation of the Recommendation or to assist the understanding or use of the Recommendation and to which conformance is not necessary.

NOTE – The term "document" refers to output (such as Standards, Recommendations, Specifications, Implementation Agreements, etc.) of other organizations (such as forums/consortia, standards development organizations, etc.).

The requirements of 2.2 and 2.3 do not apply for non-normative references, since such referenced documents are not considered to be an integral part of an ITU-T Recommendation. They are documents that add to the reader's understanding but are not essential to the implementation of, or compliance with, the Recommendation.

2.2 For normative references, the member submits a contribution to the study group or working party providing information, as outlined in 2.2.1 to 2.2.10.

The study group or working party evaluates this information and decides whether to make the reference. The preferred format for documenting the study group or working party decision is given in Appendix I.

Specific details for referencing documents of the considered organization are provided on the Databases page of the ITU-T website.

2.2.1 A clear description of the document considered for reference (type of document, title, number, version, date, etc.).

2.2.2 Status of approval. Referencing a document that has not yet been approved by the referenced organization can lead to confusion; thus, normative referencing is usually limited to approved documents. If absolutely necessary, such a reference can be made where cooperative work requiring cross-references is being approved by the ITU-T and another organization in approximately the same time frame.

2.2.3 Justification for the specific reference, including why it is inappropriate to incorporate the full text in the Recommendation.

2.2.4 Current information, if any, about IPR issues (patents, copyrights, trademarks).

2.2.5 Other information that might be useful in describing the "Quality" of the document (e.g., length of time it has existed, whether products have been implemented using it, whether conformance requirements are clear, whether the specification is readily and widely available).

2.2.6 The degree of stability or maturity of the document.

2.2.7 Relationship with other existing or emerging documents.

2.2.8 When a document is to be referenced in an ITU-T Recommendation, all explicit references within the referenced document should also be listed.

2.2.9 Qualification of referenced organization (per clause 3). This need only be done the first time a document from the referenced organization is being considered for referencing and only if such qualification information has not been documented already.

2.2.10 A full copy of the existing document. No reformatting is necessary. The objective is to have referenced documents available via the web at no cost, so that the study group or working party may proceed with its evaluation. Accordingly, if a document to be referenced is available in this manner, it is sufficient for the contributing member to provide its exact location on the web. On the other hand, if the document is not available in this manner, a full copy must be provided (in electronic format if permissible by the referenced organization, otherwise in paper format).

2.3 For normative references only, the study group or working party evaluates the above information and comes to its conclusions based on the usual consensus process. The decision of the study group or working party shall be documented using the format in Appendix I. This requirement must be completed, at the latest, at the time the Recommendation is decided under TAP or consented under AAP.

The study group or working party report may simply note that the procedures of Recommendation ITU-T A.5 have been satisfied and provide a pointer to the document where the full details reside.

2.4 If the study group or working party decides to make the reference, it should be introduced with the standard text provided in clause 2 of the "Author's guide for drafting ITU-T Recommendations". Additionally, a note shall be added stating: "NOTE – The reference to a document within this Recommendation does not give it, as a stand-alone document, the status of a Recommendation."

NOTE – In the case of texts produced jointly by ITU-T and ISO/IEC JTC 1, it is recognized that Recommendation ITU-T A.23 applies (see clause 6.6 of Appendix II within Annex A of ITU-T A.23 (2010)).

2.5 If instead of referencing, the study group or working party decides to incorporate the text of another organization into the text of a Recommendation, then permission of that organization must be obtained. At the earliest possible moment, upon the request of the study group or working party, TSB should request from the organization a written statement that it agrees to the incorporation of the specific text in ITU-T Recommendations. An applicable prior written statement may be used instead. Should the organization decline to provide such statement or fail to so, the incorporation shall not be made. In this case, the decision to incorporate the reference instead of the text must be made by consensus.

3 Qualification of referenced organizations

To ensure the continued quality of the ITU-T Recommendations, not only is it necessary to evaluate the document being proposed for reference, it is also necessary to consider the referenced organization according to the criteria set out in 3.1, 3.2 and 3.3:

3.1 The criteria used for qualifying organizations, as documented in items 1 to 6 of Annex A of Recommendation ITU-T A.4 or items 1 to 6 of Annex A of Recommendation ITU-T A.6, should be used. If the referenced organization has already been qualified according to ITU-T A.4 or ITU-T A.6, the evaluation need not be repeated, and only a note of the result is required.

3.2 In addition, the referenced organization should have a process by which its output documents are published and regularly maintained (i.e. reaffirmed, revised, withdrawn, etc.).

3.3 The referenced organization should also have a document change control process, including a clear, unambiguous document numbering scheme. In particular, a feature to look for is that updated versions of a given document be distinguishable from the earlier versions.

APPENDIX I

Format for documenting a study group or working party decision

(This appendix does not form an integral part of this Recommendation)

The decision of the study group or working party with respect to making the normative reference must be documented in the meeting record using the following format:

- 1 Clear description of the document.
(type of document, title, number, version, date, etc.).
- 2 Status of approval.
- 3 Justification for the specific reference:
(including why incorporation of the full text in the Recommendation is inappropriate).
- 4 Current information, if any, about IPR issues:
(including patents, copyrights, trademarks).
- 5 Other useful information describing the "Quality" of the document:
(e.g., length of time it has existed, whether products have been implemented using it, whether conformance requirements are clear, whether the specification is readily and widely available).
- 6 The degree of stability or maturity of the document.
- 7 Relationship with other existing or emerging documents.
- 8 When a document is referenced in an ITU-T Recommendation, all explicit references within that referenced document should also be listed.
- 9 Qualification of referenced organization:
(this need only be done the first time that a document from the referenced organization is being considered for referencing and only if such qualification information has not been documented already).
 - 9.1 Objectives.
 - 9.2 Organization: legal status and secretariat.
 - 9.3 Membership.
 - 9.4 Technical subject area.
 - 9.5 IPR policy.
 - 9.6 Working methods/processes.
 - 9.7 Document publication and maintenance process.
 - 9.8 Document change control process.
- 10 Other (for any supplementary information).