Herding Schrödinger’s Cats:  
Some conceptual tools for thinking about Internet governance

Don MacLean  
Independent Consultant  
Ottawa, Canada  
donjmac@sympatico.ca
The Internet Governance Challenge

- “Herding cats” = an impossible task

- “Schrödinger’s cat” = principles that work at the micro level do not necessarily work at the macro level

- “Herding Schrödinger’s cats” = achieving consensus between different players with conflicting views and no global framework is a challenge!
Mandate of UN Secretary-General’s Working Group on Internet Governance

*Inter alia,*

- develop a working definition of Internet governance
- identify the public policy issues that are relevant to Internet governance
- develop a common understanding of the respective roles and responsibilities of governments, the private sector, civil society, and international organizations
- prepare a report to WSIS Phase II
The Internet Governance Challenge
Outline of the Paper

• What are we talking about?
  – Internet
  – Governance
  – Internet + Governance = ?

• Internet governance issues and fora
  – What’s there?
  – What’s missing?

• Internet governance capacity (alia)
  – In international organizations
  – In developing countries and regions

• Conclusions
Methodology

• Adapt and apply conceptual tools originally developed to:
  – analyze historical patterns and current trends in governance of global electronic networks
  – map international ICT issues and decision-making fora
  – evaluate developing country participation in international ICT decision-making
## Internet Governance – A Simple View

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Government</th>
<th>IGOs, IOs, &amp; other Fora</th>
<th>Private Sector</th>
<th>Civil Society</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Issue 1</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Issue 2</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Issue 3</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Issue n</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Internet Governance According to WSIS: Not So Simple**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Internet Governance Institutional Framework</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“The international (governance) of the Internet should be:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• multilateral</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• transparent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• democratic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• with the full involvement of governments, the private sector, civil society, and international organizations”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Internet Governance Policy Framework</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goals</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• An equitable distribution of resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Facilitate access for all</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Ensure a stable and secure functioning of the Internet, with multilingualism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Roles</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• <strong>States</strong>: public policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• <strong>Private sector</strong>: technical &amp; economic development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• <strong>Civil society</strong>: community development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• <strong>Intergovernmental orgs</strong>: facilitating coordination of public policy issues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• <strong>International orgs</strong>: development technical standards and relevant policies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Information Society Governance Issues</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Partnership among all stakeholders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Access to infrastructure and services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Access to information and knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Capacity building</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Confidence and security in the use of ICTs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Enabling environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Social and economic applications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Cultural and linguistic diversity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Freedom of communication media</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Ethical dimensions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• International and regional cooperation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Internet Governance – A Complex Challenge

• *What is the Internet?*
  – The “nethead” view
  – The telecoms/broadcasting/media view
  – The network transformation view
Internet Governance – A Complex Challenge

• *What is the Internet?*
  – The “nethead” view
  – The telecoms/broadcasting/media view
  – The network transformation view

• *What is governance?*
  – “Steering, not rowing”
Internet Governance – A Complex Challenge

• *What is the Internet?*
  – The “nethead” view
  – The telecoms/broadcasting/media view
  – The network transformation view

• *What is governance?*
  – “Steering, not rowing”
  – Only laws, regulations, and standards (“hard” governance)? Or policy coordination and cooperation too (“soft” governance)?
  – Only sector-specific measures? Or generally applicable measures too?
Internet + Governance = ?

• Key to the success of the Secretary-General’s working group
• Begin with a broad approach to mapping the terrain
  – Network transformation view
  – Hard and soft governance tools
  – Full range of issues
• Identify top priorities and focus efforts
## Mapping International Internet Governance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tools for International Governance</th>
<th>“Soft”</th>
<th>“Hard”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Standards</td>
<td>Cooperation</td>
<td>Exchange of services &amp; products between sovereign nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Instruments</td>
<td>Coordination</td>
<td>Use of common resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Development of technology, networks, services in all countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Applications for equitable, sustainable global development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Scope of International Governance Arrangements**

- Narrow
- Scope of International Governance Arrangements
- Broad
Mapping Internet Governance: Some Issues

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>International Governance Tools</th>
<th>Cooperation</th>
<th>Coordination</th>
<th>Standards</th>
<th>Legal Instruments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Soft&quot;</td>
<td>DNS registries and registrars</td>
<td>Regional root servers</td>
<td>Multilingual domain names</td>
<td>Private vs. public legal instruments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Hard&quot;</td>
<td>Exchange of services &amp; products between sovereign nations</td>
<td>Use of common resources</td>
<td>Development of technology, networks, services in all countries</td>
<td>Applications for equitable, sustainable global development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Scope of International Governance Arrangements

Narrow → Scope of International Governance Arrangements → Broad
## Mapping Internet Governance: Some Issues

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>International Governance Tools</th>
<th>Cooperation</th>
<th>Coordination</th>
<th>Standards</th>
<th>Legal Instruments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Soft&quot;</td>
<td>E-commerce</td>
<td>Revenue sharing</td>
<td>IXP</td>
<td>Standards: Cybersecurity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Hard&quot;</td>
<td>Taxation</td>
<td>IPRs</td>
<td>Cybersecurity</td>
<td>DNS registries and registrars</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Scope of International Governance Arrangements

- Narrow
- Scope of International Governance Arrangements
- Broad

- Exchange of services & products between sovereign nations
- Use of common resources
- Development of technology, networks, services in all countries
- Applications for equitable, sustainable global development
# Mapping Internet Governance: Some Issues

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>International Governance Tools</th>
<th>Cooperation</th>
<th>Coordination</th>
<th>Standards</th>
<th>Legal Instruments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Soft”</td>
<td>• E-commerce</td>
<td>• Revenue sharing</td>
<td>• IXP</td>
<td>• Internet &amp; ITRs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Taxation</td>
<td>• IPRs</td>
<td>• Cyber-security</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Cyber convention?</td>
<td>• Cyber</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• IPRs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Internet &amp; ITRs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Exchange of services &amp; products between sovereign nations</th>
<th>Use of common resources</th>
<th>Development of technology, networks, services in all countries</th>
<th>Applications for equitable, sustainable global development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

- **“Hard”**
  - Narrow
  - Scope of International Governance Arrangements
  - Broad

- **Legal Instruments**
  - • Financing services and applications
  - • National e-Strategies
  - • Network-based applications
  - • Knowledge repositories
  - • Consumer protection (privacy, fraud, spam)
Mapping Internet Governance: Some Issues

**International Governance Tools**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>“Soft”</th>
<th>Cooperation</th>
<th>Coordination</th>
<th>Standards</th>
<th>Legal Instruments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• E-commerce • Taxation</td>
<td>• Revenue sharing • IPRs</td>
<td>• Cybersecurity • IPRs</td>
<td>• DNS registries and registrars • Regional root servers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Internet &amp; ITRs</td>
<td>• IXPs</td>
<td>• Internet &amp; ITRs</td>
<td>• Cybersecurity • Internet &amp; ITRs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• E-commerce • Taxation</td>
<td>• Revenue sharing • IPRs</td>
<td>• Cybersecurity • IPRs</td>
<td>• DNS registries and registrars • Regional root servers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Internet &amp; ITRs</td>
<td>• IXPs</td>
<td>• Internet &amp; ITRs</td>
<td>• Cybersecurity • Internet &amp; ITRs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Scope of International Governance Arrangements**

- Narrow
- Broad

- Applications for equitable, sustainable global development
- Financing services and applications
- National e-Strategies
- Network-based applications
- Knowledge repositories
- Consumer protection (privacy, fraud, spam)

- Financing infrastructure
- Mobile, broadband, ubiquitous networks
- IPv6
- Migration to IP-based networks
- Universal access
- Internet regulation

- Development of technology, networks, services in all countries
- Use of common resources
- Exchange of services & products between sovereign nations
- Use of common resources
Mapping Internet Governance: IGOs, IOs, and Other Fora

### International Governance Tools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>“Soft”</th>
<th>Cooperation</th>
<th>Policy Coordination</th>
<th>Standards</th>
<th>Laws and Regulations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Exchange of services &amp; products between sovereign nations</td>
<td>Use of common resources</td>
<td>Development of technology, networks, services in all countries</td>
<td>Applications for equitable, sustainable global development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Scope of International Governance

- **Narrow**
- **Broad**

**ITU & UNESCO**
### Mapping Internet Governance: IGOs, IOs, and Other Fora

**Applications for equitable, sustainable global development**

- Development of technology, networks, services in all countries
- Use of common resources
- Exchange of services & products between sovereign nations
- Applications for equitable, sustainable global development

**International Governance Tools**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Laws and Regulations</th>
<th>Standards</th>
<th>Policy Coordination</th>
<th>Cooperation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **WTO**
- **ITU & UNESCO**
- **WIPO**

**Scope of International Governance**

- Narrow
- **Scope of International Governance**
- Broad
Mapping Internet Governance: IGOs, IOs, and Other Fora

Applications for equitable, sustainable global development

Use of common resources

Development of technology, networks, services in all countries

Applications for equitable, sustainable global development

Laws and Regulations

“Hard”

International Governance Tools

“Soft”

Cooperation

Scope of International Governance

Narrow

Cooperation

Policy Coordination

WTO

Exchange of services & products between sovereign nations

Use of common resources

Development of technology, networks, services in all countries

Applications for equitable, sustainable global development

IJU & UNESCO

ITU & UNESCO

IETF

ICT & UNESCO

WTO

WIPO

International Telecommunication Union
Mapping Internet Governance: IGOs, IOs, and Other Fora

Scope of International Governance

“Soft”

“Hard”

Cooperation

Policy Coordination

Standards

Laws and Regulations

Exchange of services & products between sovereign nations

Use of common resources

Development of technology, networks, services in all countries

Applications for equitable, sustainable global development

|| IETF || ICANN || ITU & UNESCO || WORLD BANK || WIPO ||
|---|---|---|---|---|---|

Narrow

Scope of International Governance

Broad
Mapping Internet Governance: IGOs, IOs, and Other Fora

Development of technology, networks, services in all countries
Use of common resources
Development of technology, networks, services in all countries
Applications for equitable, sustainable global development

Exchange of services & products between sovereign nations

“Soft”

“Hard”

International Governance Tools

Cooperation
Policy Coordination
Standards
Laws and Regulations

UNCTAD
ITU & UNESCO
ICANN
WTO
UNDP
WORLD BANK
IETF
ITU & UNESCO

“Hard”

WTO

IETF

Scope of International Governance

Narrow

Broad
Mapping Internet Governance: Civil Society and the Private Sector

- Development Assistance
- Policy Coordination
- Standards
- Laws and Regulations

| Scope of International Governance Tools | Narrow |  | Broad |
|----------------------------------------|--------|-----------------|
| Exchange of services & products between sovereign nations | | |
| Use of common resources | | |
| Development of technology, networks, services in all countries | | |
| Application for equitable, sustainable global development | | |
Mapping Internet Governance: Civil Society and the Private Sector

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>International Governance Tools</th>
<th>Development Assistance</th>
<th>Policy Coordination</th>
<th>Standards</th>
<th>Laws and Regulations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Soft”</td>
<td>Exchange of services &amp; products between sovereign nations</td>
<td>Use of common resources</td>
<td>Development of technology, networks, services in all countries</td>
<td>Application for equitable, sustainable global development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CIVIL SOCIETY

DEVELOPMENT NGOs

Narrow ← Scope of International Governance → Broad
Mapping Internet Governance: Civil Society and the Private Sector

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>International Governance Tools</th>
<th>&quot;Soft&quot;</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Laws and Regulations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standards</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy Coordination</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development Assistance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

"Hard"

CIVIL SOCIETY

PRIVATE SECTOR STANDARDIZATION FORUMS

BUSINESS NGOs

DEVELOPMENT NGOs

Exchange of services & products between sovereign nations

Use of common resources

Development of technology, networks, services in all countries

Application for equitable, sustainable global development

Narrow

Scope of International Governance

Broad
# Mapping Internet Governance: Civil Society and the Private Sector

![Diagram showing the scope of international governance tools and their impact on civil society, business NGOs, development NGOs, and regulatory practitioners.](diagram.png)

## International Governance Tools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tool</th>
<th>Narrow</th>
<th>Scope of International Governance</th>
<th>Broad</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Laws and Regulations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standards</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy Coordination</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development Assistance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Scope of International Governance

- **Soft**
- **Hard**

## Tools

### Development Assistance
- Exchange of services & products between sovereign nations
- Use of common resources
- Development of technology, networks, services in all countries
- Application for equitable, sustainable global development
Internet Governance Holes

Tools for International Governance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>&quot;Soft&quot;</th>
<th>Cooperation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Coordination</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standards</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Instruments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| "Hard" |
| Exchange of services & products between sovereign nations |
| Use of common resources |
| Development of technology, networks, services in all countries |
| Applications for equitable, sustainable global development |

Network & Information Security
Developing country technical/policy capacity
Citizen/Consumer protection

Scope of International Governance Arrangements
Narrow ← Scope of International Governance Arrangements → Broad
The International ICT Governance Process

INTERNATIONAL DECISION-MAKING

Agenda Setting → Proposals → Decisions

NATIONAL AND REGIONAL POLICY FORMULATION

Issue Identification → Policy Formulation → Policy Coordination → Implementation

DEEP POLICY STRUCTURES

Policy Assessment → Policy Research & Analysis → Evaluation
Obstacles to Inclusive Governance

• International level
  – Lack of easy, affordable and timely access to information
  – Structure, functioning and working methods of international fora
  – Ineffective use of financial resources available for participation

• National and regional level
  – Lack of awareness among decision-makers
  – Lack of technical and policy capacity on ICT issues
  – Weaknesses in national and regional ICT policy processes and institutions
Conclusions

• The paper presents 9 conclusions. The most important are:
  – In designing governance arrangements, let “form follow function”
  – It is critically important to fill governance gaps in the areas of information and network security, and protection of citizen rights and consumer interests
  – Efforts to develop inclusive Internet governance arrangements will be ineffective unless parallel measures are taken to build capacity in developing countries, under “southern” leadership
Herding Schrödinger's Cats