

**Document Number: V1.0/B**

Note: This document lists the comments received by WSIS Stakeholders from the 9th October to 17th November. All submissions available at: <http://www.itu.int/wsis/review/mpp/pages/consolidated-texts.html>

This document has been developed keeping in mind the Principles.

This document builds on the outcome of the first Review of the WSIS , including the Final Statement: <http://www.unesco.org/new/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/CI/CI/pdf/wsis/WSIS_10_Event/wsis10_outcomes_en.pdf> .

Please note that the Geneva Declaration and the Geneva Plan of Action still remain valid until further decisions by the General Assembly.

Draft WSIS+10 Vision for WSIS Beyond 2015

* **Access**: Draft WSIS+10 Vision for Beyond 2015
* **CDT**: Draft WSIS+10 Vision for a WSIS Beyond 2015: The phrasing of this document supposes a continuation of the WSIS process. This is far from clear and no decision has yet been taken to that effect. The modalities of a post 2015 WSIS have not been discussed or agreed and no consultation as to its potential continuation has been conducted. If there is a WSIS post 2015 then it should be built upon and around the post 2015 development agenda priorities.
* **Russia**: Draft WSIS+10 Vision Beyond 2015

### B. Priority areas to be addressed in the implementation of WSIS Beyond 2015.

### Access: B. Priority areas to be addressed Beyond 2015.

### CDT: B. Priority areas to be addressed in the post 2015 development agenda

### GPD: B. Priority areas to be addressed in the implementation of a development framework beyond 2015.

### Sweden: B. Priority areas to be addressed in the implementation of WSIS Beyond 2015 in the post-2015 development framework.

### Russia: B. Priority areas to be addressed in the implementation of WSIS+10 Beyond 2015

* **United Kingdom**: Proposed text on mainstreaming: Given the success of WSIS Action Lines in spreading the benefits of the Information Society and Knowledge Economy since 2005, there are some elements that no longer require attention under the WSIS process. To acknowledge the success of the WSIS process, WSIS Stakeholders should identify Action Lines which are now mainstream within society, and consider those Action Lines complete. This will allow all stakeholders to focus resources on those remaining Action Lines where the objectives are yet to be achieved
* **GPD**: **[We suggest either to only keep the top-level bullets (as above) or reorganize the entire section by sub-headings as below. The organizing principle at the moment is unclear. Also, a number of bullets below are repetitive of the above language and could be grouped together under more comprehensive categories, e.g.** Use of ICTs for social and economic development; Bridging the digital divide, access and affordability; Respecting and promoting human rights; Improving governance of ICTs; Encouraging and maintaining of open standards and open innovation in the ICT sector; etc.**.]**
* **ISOC**: Overall, this section is probably too lengthy to be useful. Given the principle that this document should avoid prejudging the outcomes of the 68th Session of the General Assembly on modalities of the Overall Review, higher-level text would seem more useful than an in-depth list of all existing issues. In addition, many key forward-looking issues are already contained in the Vision Preamble (V1-A). Merging V1-A and V1-B could be a possible solution.
* **Iran**: Regarding to the Document V1/B, It appears that topics such as “***Personal Data Protection”*** and **“*Protecting the privacy of ICT and internet users”*** should not be limited successively to ***“Cyber security”*** and ***“Commercial exploitation and government intrusion”***. These essential topics are more general and can be subsumed under the ***“Priority areas to be addressed in the implementation of WSIS Beyond 2015”***, considering their importance and vastness. The same observation is noticeable in regards to the Document V1-C-ALC5 which deals with ***“Confidence and security in the use of ICTs”***.
* **GPD**: With the rapid development of ICTs over the past ten years, their mainstreaming in our everyday lives, and their increasingly important role in human development, the role of the Information Society going forward should be seen and developed in the broader context of the post-2015 development agenda. A comprehensive and objective assessment of the WSIS framework and its Action Lines will be crucial in determining whether this is the most appropriate and effective vehicle for harnessing the potential of ICTs for development.

There are number of priority areas that needs to be addressed in the implementation of WSIS beyond 2015, due to its effect in the development process and strengthening the move towards building Information Society and Knowledge Economy. Those areas come in light of the improvements that emerge from the ICT sector itself, in addition to the demands of the other sectors of the economy and the society which urges its enhancement.

* **United** **Kingdom**: In addition, there a number of priority areas that needs to be addressed in the implementation of WSIS beyond 2015, due to its effect in the development process and strengthening the move towards building Information Society and Knowledge Economy. Those areas come in light of the improvements that emerge from the ICT sector itself, in addition to the demands of the other sectors of the economy and the society which urges its enhancement.
* **IFIP**: There are a number of priority areas that need to be addressed in the implementation of WSIS beyond 2015, due to their effect in the development process and strengthening the move towards building the Information Society and Knowledge Economy. Those areas come in light of the improvements that emerge from the ICT sector itself, in addition to the demands of the other sectors of the economy and the society which urges its enhancement
* **ISOC**: There a number of priority areas that might need to be addressed in the implementation of WSIS beyond 2015, if any, due to its effect in the development process and strengthening the move towards building Information Society and Knowledge Economy. Those areas come in light of the changes that emerge from the ICT sector itself, in addition to the demands of the other sectors of the economy and the society.
* **Access**: There are a number of areas that have been identified by WSIS stakeholders as priorities for the post- 2015 development agenda. Those areas come in light of the improvements that emerge from the ICT sector itself, in addition to the demands of the other sectors of the economy and the society which urges its enhancement. But with the rapid development of ICTs over the past ten years and the mainstreaming of ICTs into everyday life, the link between ICTs and human development is increasingly important. Therefore, it is necessary for the role of the Information Society going forward to be seen and developed in the broader context of the post-2015 development agenda. A comprehensive and objective assessment of the WSIS framework and its Action Lines will be critical for determining the most appropriate and effective vehicle for harnessing the potential of ICTs for development.
* **GPD**: With this in mind, there a number of priority areas that ought to be addressed as part of the revised WSIS framework (or its equivalent) beyond 2015. Those areas come in light of the improvements that emerge from the ICT sector itself, in addition to the demands of the other sectors of the economy and the society which urges its enhancement
* **Russia**: There a number of priority areas that needs to be addressed in the implementation of WSIS+10 beyond 2015, due to its effect in the development process and strengthening the move towards building Information and Knowledge based Society . Those areas come in light of the improvements that emerge from the ICT sector itself, in addition to the demands of the other sectors of the economy and the society which urges its enhancement.

We, the WSIS Stakeholders have identified the topics below as priority areas to be addressed in the implementation of WSIS Beyond 2015:

* **Access**: We, the WSIS Stakeholders have identified the topics below as priority areas to be addressed beyond 2015:
* **CDT**: We, the WSIS Stakeholders have identified the topics below as priority areas to be addressed in the post 2015 development agenda:
* **GPD**: We, the WSIS Stakeholders have identified the topics below as priority areas to be addressed in order to maximize the potential of ICTs for development beyond 2015:
* **Russia**: We, the WSIS+10 Stakeholders have identified the topics below as priority areas to be addressed in the implementation of WSIS+10 Beyond 2015:

[The list below has been partly regrouped by themes,

it is NOT a hierarchical listing of priorities]

1. *Bridging* the **digital divide** still remains a crucial task.

* **United Kingdom:** *Bridging* the **digital divide** will remain a crucial task: as technology moves on, bringing its benefits to early adopters, it will contine to be important to ensure that others are not left behind
* **GPD**: *Bridging* the **digital divide**.
* **Sweden**: *Bridging* the **digital divide**.
* **GESCI:** With emphasis placed on rural vs. urban due to all manners of poverty being concentrated more highly in rural areas, especially in SSA.

1. Achieving the global concept of **Information society** is still to be attained.

* **UK**: Delete
* **Access**: Not clear what this means. Recommend deleting.
* **CDT**: Delete
* **GPD**:Delete
* **Sweden**:Deleted
* **Russia**: Achieving the global concept of **Information and Knowledge based society** is still to be attained.
* **GESCI:** Why are we not trying to develop a global concept of ‘Knowledge Society’ instead? It goes further than an ‘Information Society’ in that it places the emphasis on knowledge as valuable commodity and not just information.

1. **Iran**: Making the use of ICTs safe for children and families
2. *Increasing* **access to and use of ICTs**, including broadband and mobile services through continued and increasing practical implementation measures, should be the primary focus for WSIS for the next 10 years.

* **CDT**: *Increasing* **access to and use of ICTs**, including broadband and mobile services through continued and increasing practical implementation measures
* **GPD**: *Increasing* **access to and use of ICTs**, particularly to vulnerable groups, including broadband and mobile services through continued and increasing practical implementation measures.
* **Russia**: *Increasing* **access to and use of ICTs**, including broadband and mobile services through continued and increasing practical implementation measures, at the same time taking steps to increase the “culture of security in the use of ICTs”, should be the primary focus for WSIS for the next 10 years.

1. **GPD**: *Conducting* a comprehensive and objective assessment ofthe WSIS and the WSIS Action Linesin order to *identify* the most appropriate model to harness the potential of ICTs for development within the framework of a post-2015 development agenda
2. **CDT**: *Fully and objectively assessing* the WSIS and the WSIS Action Lines to determine whether they are the most appropriate and effective model for harnessing the potential of ICTs for development in a post 2015 development agenda.
3. **GPD**: Respecting and promoting humanrights are essential prerequisites to realizing the **development and policy goals of a post 2015 development agenda**

Improving the **governance of ICTs**, including the extension of the principle of multi-stakeholder participation to all areas of national and international ICT governance.

1. *Renewing* attention to **deepen and strengthen the actions** taken in implementing the Action Lines (with lessons learned over the past ten years).

* **UK***: Renewing* attention to **update the actions** taken in implementing the Action Lines (with lessons learned over the past ten years).
* **IFIP**: *Renewing* attention to **deepening and strengthening the actions** taken in implementing the Action Lines (with an evaluation of the lessons learned over the past ten years so that others may benefit from the experience).
* **Access**: *Fully, independently, and objectively assessing* the WSIS framework, in particular the Action Lines, to determine whether they are the most appropriate and effective model for harnessing the potential of ICTs for development in a post 2015 development agenda.
* **CDT**: Delete
* **GPD**: Delete
* **USA**: *Renewing* attention to **deepen and strengthen the actions** taken in implementing the Action Lines (with lessons learned over the past ten years and to address the challenges we face today).
* **Sweden**: *Renewing* attention to **updating the actions** taken in implementing the Action Lines (with lessons learned over the past ten years).
* **Russia***: Renewing* attention to **deepen and strengthen the actions** taken in implementing the WSIS Action Lines (with lessons learned over the past ten years).

1. **Redefining the WSIS Action lines**, in order to address the challenges we face today.

* **UK: Redefining the WSIS Action lines (where applicable)**, in order to address the challenges we face today, and refocusing attention and resources away from Action lines that have been completed, towards those that need increased attention.
* **Access**: **Reviewing the WSIS Action lines**, in order to determine whether they address the challenges we face today.
* **CDT**: **Assessing and redefining the WSIS Action lines or their equivalent**, in order to address the challenges we face today.
* **GPD**: Delete
* **ICANN**: **Reviewing the WSIS Action lines**, in order to assess the challenges we face today
* **ISOC**: **Adjusting the WSIS Action lines**, in order to address the challenges we face today.
* **USA**: **Review the WSIS Action lines**, in order to assess whether updates are needed to address the challenges we face today.
* **Sweden**: **Redefining the WSIS Action lines to align with the overall post-2015 development goals**, in order to address the challenges we face today.

1. **UK**: **Acknowledging successful mainstreaming of WSIS goals**, and retiring WSIS Action linesthat have been completed
2. Emphasise on the creation of **WSIS/ICT National Strategies and Policies.**

* **Access:** Emphasizing on the importance of national strategies and policies for the advancement of **WSIS /ICT for development goals.**
* **CDT:** Emphasizing the importance of the creation of **National Strategies and Policies** for ICTs for development
* **GPD**: *Emphasizing* the importance of the creation of appropriate **National Strategies and Policies** to harness the potential of ICTs for development**.**
* **GESCI:** And promoting coherence of policy across regions, especially in Africa. Focusing on realistic policies also important, those that are implementable.

1. *Cooperating* at the **National, Regional and Global level** is essential.

* **Access**: *Cooperati*on among all stakeholders at the **National, Regional and Global level** is essential.
* **CDT**: Delete

1. *Creating* **global guidelines or principles for online code of ethics** is a key requirement

* **UK***: People*Building *people’s having confidence in their ability to manage their online experience*
* **IFIP**: *Creating* **global guidelines or principles for online code of ethics** is a key requirement NOTE IS THIS MEANT TO COVER THE BEHAVIOUR OF USERS? OR THE CREATORS AND PROVIDERS OF ONLINE SERVICES?
* **ICANN**: Deleted
* **ISOC**: *Discussing* **principles for online code of ethics** is important.
* **Access**: *Creating* **global guidelines or principles for online code of ethics** rooted in international human rights frameworks, such as the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, may be desirable.
* **CDT**: This is far from agreed among stakeholders
* **GPD**: *Promoting* **global guidelines or principles for online code of ethics** rooted in the international human rights framework
* **Sweden**: Deleted

1. UK: **Highlight best practice** to encourage confidence in the use of ICTs.
2. *Setting* adapted **laws and frameworks that converge** with the basic principles of inclusive information society.

* **ICANN**: Deleted
* **CDT**: *Encouraging* **laws and frameworks that converge** with the basic principles of inclusive information society.
* **ISOC**: *Encouraging the development of* **frameworks that converge** with the basic principles of inclusive information society.
* **Access**: *Encouraging* **laws and frameworks that converge** with the basic principles of inclusive information society.
* **GPD**:Encouraging **laws and frameworks that converge** with the basic principles of inclusive information society
* **USA**: *Setting* **laws and frameworks that converge** with with the basic principles of inclusive information society.

1. **International Structures and organization** should play a central role in the follow up and evaluation of achievements.

* **Japan**: Deleted, We believe multistakeholder approach is important.
* **UK**: **International, regional and national structures and organizationsorganizationorganizations** should all play a role in the follow up and evaluation of achievements.
* **Egypt**: **International Structures and organization** should play a central role in the follow up and evaluation of achievements, taking into consideration the multistakholderism principle.
* **ICANN**: **All stakeholders** should play a central role in the follow up and evaluation of achievements.
* **Access**: **International Structures and organization** should play a central role in the post-2015 development framework.
* **CDT**: **All stakeholders**  should play a central role in the follow up and evaluation of post 2015 development related achievements.
* **USA**: **International and Regional Structures and Organizations** should play an important role in the follow up and evaluation of achievements
* **Iran**: - International Structures and organization confirmed by the governments should play a central role in the follow up and evaluation of achievements
* **Russia: Intergovernmental and International Structures and organization** should play an important role in the follow up and evaluation of achievements.

1. *Encouraging* and maintaining **open standards and open innovation** in the ICT sector and the internet.

* **USA**: *Encouraging* and maintaining **open standards and innovation** in the ICT sector and the Internet.

1. *Focusing* on the **quality of e-services** is crucial.

* **USA**: *Focusing* on the **quality of e-services** is essential.
* **Russia**: *Focusing* on the optimum set, **quality and security of e-services** is crucial.

1. *Promoting the* **Digital Economy.**

* **UK:** *Promoting a* **Digital Economy [**according to in line with WTO principles]**.**
* **Russia:** *Promoting a* **Digital Economy**, including creating equal possibilities in creating and providing online services**.**

1. **APIG:** Addressing the **tax challenges** of the digital economy.
2. *Ensuring* the **free flow of data** to promote e-commerce and international free trade

* **Russia**: *Ensuring* the promotion of e-commerce and international free trade

1. *Using* **providers of public access**, such as libraries as the main platform to access the information resources .

* **IFLA**: *Supporting* **providers of public access in the community**, such as libraries, to help peopleaccess information resources they need and develop information literacy skills
* **IFIP**: *Recognising* **providers of public access**, such as libraries as an important platform to access the information resources.
* **ICANN**: *Using* **providers of public access**, such as libraries as an important platform to access the information resources .
* **Russia**: *Using* **providers of public access**, such as libraries to access the information resources they need to improve their lives.

1. *Exploring* all **affordable options** for information access rather than reliance on market-based information.

* **UK***: Exploring* all **affordable options** for to enable affordable information access, including but not limited to
* **USA**: *Exploring* all **affordable options** for information access rather than sole reliance on market-based information.
* **Russia:** *Exploring and promoting* all **affordable options** for information access rather than reliance on market-based information.

1. *Supporting* the **development and implementation of cloud computing** and its policies.

* **USA***: Supporting policies to promote* the **development and implementation of cloud computing**.
* **Russia**: Deleted

1. *Ensuring***accessibility for people with disabilities.**
2. **IFLA***: Urging* governments and intergovernmental organizations as well as private institutions and organisations to pursue policies and programs that advocate for and promote Media and Information Literacy and Lifelong Learning for all
3. *Clear commitment* from governments and intergovernmental organizations to **support and facilitate enabling regulatory and investment environments**.

* **Japan**: Deleted, We believe multistakeholder approach is important.
* **ISOC**: *Clear commitment* from all stakeholders to support investment and develop enabling environments.
* **USA***: Clear commitment* from governments and intergovernmental organizations to **support and facilitate enabling legal and investment environments**.

1. **Iran**: Recognizing and respecting to the every nation-state’s sovereignty in information society and the national government’s obligation to protect national ICT infrastructures and services and its citizens’ rights

* ***Human Rights:***
* **Iran*:*** Iran: We have concern and comment in this matter which provide later.

1. Respecting and promoting humanrights are essential prerequisites to realizing the **development and policy goals of a post 2015 development agenda and the WSIS Process beyond 2015.** .

* **CDT**: Respecting and promoting humanrights are essential prerequisites to realizing the **development and policy goals of a post 2015 development agenda**.

1. *Strengthening* the **interconnection between human rights online and offline** – both the reinforcement of the rights of freedom of expression, the right to privacy, information and association on the internet as well as economic, social and cultural rights;

* **UK**: *Strengthening* the **interconnection between human rights online and offline** – both the reinforcement of the rights of freedom of expression, the right to privacy, information and association on the internet;
* **ISOC**: *Ensuring the enjoyment of* **human rights online and offline** – and especially the rights of freedom of expression, the right to privacy, information and association on the internet as well as economic, social and cultural rights;
* **USA**: *Strengthening* the **interconnection between human rights online and offline** – including the rights of freedom of expression, peaceful assembly and association, privacy rights, Internetas well as economic, social and cultural rights;
* Russia: *Strengthening* rights of freedom of expression, right to privacy, information and association on the internet as well as economic, social and cultural rightsin accordance with international law;

1. *Encourage and facilitate* **people-centered and inclusive governance models** and mechanisms that are based on human rights and the rule of law.
2. *Ensuring* that surveillance conforms to universally accepted **human rights** principles.

* **Access**: *Ensuring* that surveillance conforms to universally accepted **human rights** principles. The International Principles on the Application of Human Rights to Communications Surveillance (necessaryandproportionate.org) provide guidance on how international human rights law applies in the current digital environment, particularly in light of the increase in and changes to communications surveillance technologies and techniques.
* **USA***: Ensuring* that surveillance conforms to international human rights obligations and commitments.
* **Russia**: Deleted
* ***Use of ICTs for Social and Economic Development***
* ***UK: Title deleted***

1. *Strengthening* the use and development of **transformative technology** to enable more sustainable social and economic development.
2. *Using* the information society **as a tool to realise the post 2015 development goals**.

* **ISOC***: Harnessing the potential of ICTs to strive towards* **the post 2015 development goals**.
* **Russia:** *Using* the information society **as an environment instead of a tool to realise the post 2015 development goals**.

1. *Ensuring* a connection between the key aim of the WSIS, that of harnessing the potential of information and communication technology to promote and realize development goals, and the **post 2015 development agenda**.

* **Access**: *Ensuring* a direct link between the key aim of the WSIS, that of harnessing the potential of information and communication technology to promote and realize development goals, and the **post 2015 development agenda**
* **CDT:** *Ensuring* a direct linkage between the key aim of the WSIS, that of harnessing the potential of information and communication technology to promote and realize development goals, and the **post 2015 development agenda**.
* **GPD**: *Ensuring* a clear and direct link between the key aim of the WSIS, that of harnessing the potential of information and communication technology to promote and realize development goals, and the **post 2015 development agenda**.
* **Sweden:** *Ensuring* a explicit connection between the key aim of the WSIS, that of harnessing the potential of information and communication technology to promote and realize development goals, and the **post 2015 development agenda**.

1. GESCI: *ICTs for skills development essential for economic development in Africa due to high youth uemployment and poor literacy and numeracy skills. Without better skilled youth (leveraged through ICTs) economic growth will not be inclusive and will not reduce poverty levels, because job creation will remain illusive.*
2. **Sweden**: Allow WSIS to have its own follow-up process but direct efforts so that they align to the overall development objectives. This would recognize that technology is not an end in itself, but should be used to serve the freater purpose – improvement of people’s lives.

* ***Gender:***
* **UK*: Title deleted***

1. *Prioritizing* **gender as a standalone goal** and action line, there needs to be both reference to gender within action lines, as well as discrete and fuller treatment of gender issues in their own right. This dual stream approach to gender is similarly being advocated for in the post 2015 context.

* **UK** Deleted
* **USA**: *Prioritizing consideration of* **gender in the implementation of all WSIS action lines**.

1. **UK*: Mainstreaming gender issues*** *within action line, to ensure action lines take account of continuing gender issues and redress discrimination.*
2. *Ending* **technology-based violence against women and girls**.

* **UK:** Deleted
* **Access**: *Ending* **technology-based violence and harassment against women, girls, and any individual based on their sexual orientation or gender identity**.
* **GPD**: *Ending* **technology-based violence against women and girls**, or in fact any individual based on their sexual orientation or gender identity.
* **USA**: *Ending* **technology-based harrassment against women and girls**.

1. GESCI: *Promotion of technology for women’s professional development and further education, which encourages training, further study and information learning for women who are shouldering home and family responsibilities and therefore cannot attend full-time education and training programmes.*
2. *Ensuring* that women's rights are taken into account in **internet rights and principles** and dialogue.

* **UK**:
* Ensure that the opportunities offered by the use of ICTs to reduce and redress discrimination, and to prevent violence against women and girls, are fully utilised.
* Prioritise the use of ICTs by women and girls for education and social equality, especially amongst the most vulnerable groups
* *Ensuring* that women's rights are taken into account in **internet rights and principles** and dialogue.[.[.
* **Egypt**: Internet rights are equal for both gender. Unless there is a certain point that need to be mentioned explicitly.
* **USA***: Ensuring* that women's rights are taken into account in dialogue on human rights and the Internet**Internet**.

**UNESCO**: Disability :

1. *Formulating* **disability-inclusive development frameworks**
2. *Ensuring***accessibility of information, services and ICTs for people with disabilities.**
3. *Empowering and* ***building capacities*** *of person with disabilities to access information and knowledge using ICTs in order becoming an equal contributors of society*
4. *Ensuring* ***universal design for all*** *that contribute to the development of inclusive, accessible and affordable ICTs and services for persons with disabilities*

* ***Multistakeholderism***
* **UK*: Title deleted***

1. *Ensuring* open and decentralized **multi-stakeholder models and mechanisms** in the WSIS Process.

* **ICANN**: *Ensuring* open and inclusive **multi-stakeholder models and mechanisms** in the WSIS Process.
* **Access**: *Ensuring* open and decentralized **multi-stakeholder models and mechanisms** in all internet/ICT-related public policy making.
* **CDT**: *Ensuring* open and decentralized **multi-stakeholder models and mechanisms**.
* **GPD**: *Ensuring* open and decentralized **multi-stakeholder models and mechanisms** in all ICT governance processes, including the WSIS Process or its post-2015 equivalent.
* **Iran**: We have concern and comment in this matter which provide later.

1. Improvement in the **governance of ICTs**, including the extension of the principle of multi-stakeholder participation, which has been so successful on the **internet**, into other areas of national and international ICT governance.

* **UK**: Improvement in the **governance of ICTs**, including the extension of the multi-stakeholder principle of multi-stakeholder participation, which has been so successful in allowing all interested stakeholder to participate in discussions and decision-making in the Internet organizationson the **internet**, into other areas of national and international ICT governance.
* **ICANN**: Further deepening and broadening of the multistakeholder process in the **governance of ICTs**, which has been so successful for **internet governance**, including expanding this model into other areas of national and international ICT governance.
* **Russia:** Improvement in the **governance of ICTs**, including the extension of the principle of multi-stakeholder participation and defining the roles and responsibilities of all stakeholders.
  + ***Internet:***

***CDT:*** Not sure of the value of calling out the Internet when this vision is about ICTs for development – suggest reworking the structure so that this section addresses ICT issues (Internet, broadband, etc.)

***Russia***: Governments should have an equal role and responsibility for international Internet governance and for ensuring the stability, security and continuity of the Internet, taking into account the convergence of networks, services

*Emphasizing* the importance of **maintaining an open Internet** based on open standards development processes, and open governance as key enablers for an inclusive knowledge and information societies as a priority issue in the next ten years.

* **CDT**: *Emphasizing* the importance of **maintaining an open Internet** based on open standards development processes, and open governance as key enablers for an inclusive knowledge and information societies.
* **Iran**: We have concern and comment in this matter which provide later.

1. **Enabling** **Internet access** for all and Internet as a leapfrog for development.

* **Access**: *Enabling* **Internet access** for all and Internet, as an enabler for development.
* **CDT**: *Enabling* **Internet access** for all.
* **GPD**: *Enabling* **Internet access** for all.

1. Ensuring the protection of the **internet's** security and integrity and lowering the cost of Internet access for users in developing countries.

* **UK**: EnsuringPromoting the protection of the **internet's** security and integrity and lowering the cost of Internet access for users in developing countries.
* **Egypt**: Ensuring the protection of the **internet's** security and integrity and lowering the cost of Internet access for users in developing countries and LDCs
* **ICANN**: Ensuring that all stakeholders have access to best-practice guidelines on safeguarding integrity and cybersecurity when accessing the **Internet**, and lowering the cost of Internet access for users in developing countries.
* **Access**: Ensuring the protection of the **internet's** security and integrity through a multistakeholder approach.
* **CDT**: Ensuring the multi-stakeholder protection of the **internet's** security and integrity
* **GPD**: *Ensuring* the multi-stakeholder protection of the **internet's** security and integrity
* **Russia:** Ensuring the protection of the **internet's** security, stability and integrity.
* **Sweden:**
  + Ensuring the protection of the **internet's** security and integrity
  + Working towards creating policies that lower the cost of Internet access for users in developing countries.

1. Working towards **multilingualization of the Internet** including email, search engines and native capability for Unicode.

* **Access**: Working towards lowering the cost of Internet access for users in developing countries
* **CDT**: *Working towards* lowering the cost of Internet access for users in developing countries.
* **GPD**: Working towards lowering the cost of Internet access for users in developing countries.

1. *Exploring* ***t*echnical evolution of the Internet** to address known weaknesses and to increase speed and capability, while maintaining full interoperability and stability.

* **CDT***: Encouraging stakeholders to work together to* identify and address known technical weaknesses in ICTs and to increase speed and capability, while maintaining full interoperability and stability.
* **USA**: Supporting continued***t*echnical evolution of the Internet** to address known weaknesses and to increase speed and capability, while maintaining full interoperability and stability.

1. *Promoting* **affordable internet** through infrastructure development and free competition.

* **UNESCO:** *Promoting* **affordable, accessible and multilingual internet** through infrastructure development and free competition.
* **CDT**: *Promoting* **affordable internet** through infrastructure development and competition.
* **USA**: *Promoting* **affordable Internet** through infrastructure development and effective competition.
* **Russia**: *Promoting* **affordable Internet** access, especially in developing countries, through infrastructure development and free competition.

1. *Building* **enabling environments** and ensuring the continued openness and neutrality.

* **USA**: *Building* **enabling environments** and ensuring the continued openness of the Internet.

1. *Enabling* open, democratic, transparent and multistakeholder mechanisms for **internet governance**;

* **ICANN**: *Enabling* an open, democratic, transparent and multistakeholder mechanism for **internet governance**, enabling all stakeholders to participate on an equal footing.
* **Russia:** *Enabling* an open, democratic, transparent and multistakeholder mechanism for **internet governance**, according to the respective roles and responsibilities of each stakeholder

1. *Actualization* of **enhanced cooperation**, to enable governments, on an equal footing, to carry out their roles and responsibilities, in international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet.

* **UK**: *[Continuation* of **enhanced cooperation**, to enable governments and other stakeholders, on an equal footing, to carry out their roles and responsibilities, with respect to public policy issues pertaining to the Internet.] – WSIS para 69 issue – CSTD Working Group on Enhanced Cooperation is currently discussing issue and is due to report in Spring 2014.
* **ICANN**: Deleted
* **Egypt**: *Actualization* of **enhanced cooperation**, to enable governments, on an equal footing, to carry out their roles and responsibilities, in international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet but not in the day-to-day technical and operational matters, that do not impact on international public policy issues.
* **ISOC***: E***nhancing cooperation of all stakeholder and** enabling governments, on an equal footing, to carry out their roles and responsibilities, in international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet.
* **Access**: *Strengthening* **enhanced cooperation**, to enable governments, as well as all stakeholders, to carry out their roles and responsibilities on an equal footing, in international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet.
* **CDT**: **enhanced cooperation**in international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet.
* **USA**: *Promoting and strengthening* **enhanced cooperation**, to enable governments, as well as other stakeholders on an equal footing, to carry out their roles and responsibilities, in international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet.
* **Sweden**: This is under progress already, through the CSTD WGEH
* **Russia:** *Actualization* of **enhanced cooperation**, so that governments carry out, on an equal footing, their roles and responsibilities in international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet.

1. APIG: Acceleration of the globalization of ICANN and IANA functions.

* ***Cybersecurity***

1. **Iran**: Promoting Cyber-securityand attention to child on line protection.
2. *Generating* trust in the use of ICTs should be deemed a priority, generating guarantees regarding topics such as **personal data protection and cyber security** is critical. Governance and Strengthened Cooperation in cybersecurity are other areas that should be prioritized.

* **UK**: *Generating* trust in the use of ICTs should be deemed a priority, generating guaranteesparticularly regardingnotably for topics such as **personal data protection and cyber security** is critical. Governance and Strengthened Cooperation in Helping developing countries to identify cybersecurity best practice areis another other areas that should be prioritized.
* **Access**: *Generating* trust in the use of ICTs, such as **personal data protection and cyber security** is critical. Multistakholder governance and strengthened cooperation between all stakeholders in cybersecurity are other areas that should be prioritized.
* **CDT**: *Generating* trust in the use of ICTs should be deemed a priority, particularly regarding topics such as **personal data protection and cyber security**. Multistakeholder governance and strengthened cooperation in cybersecurity are other areas that should be prioritized.
* **GPD**: *Generating* trust in the use of ICTs should be deemed a priority, generating guarantees regarding topics such as **personal data protection and cyber security** is critical. Multistakeholder cooperation in cybersecurity should be prioritized.
* **USA**: *Building confidence and security* in the use of ICTs should continue as a priority, focusing on enhancing national and regional capacity to address cybersecurity challenges. Strengthened Cooperation in cybersecurity between computer incident response teams is another area that should be prioritized.
* **Sweden**: *Generating* trust in the use of ICTs should be deemed a priority, generating guarantees regarding topics such as **personal data protection and cyber security** is critical. Strengthened multistakeholder cooperation in cybersecurity should be prioritized.
* **Russia**: *Generating* trust in the use of ICTs should be deemed a priority, generating guarantees regarding topics such as **personal data protection, privacy, security** and robustness of networks is critical. Strengthened Cooperation in this topic is other area that should be prioritized.

1. *Protecting* the privacy of **ICT and internet users** against commercial exploitation and government intrusion.

* **Iran:** *Protecting* the privacy of **ICT and internet users** against commercial exploitation and government intrusion including foreign countries government intrusion.
* Russia: Deleted

1. **IFIP:** Adoption of appropriate codes of ethics and professional practice by those charged with cybersecurity services to national governments
2. *Promoting* **Cybersecurity** and attention to child on line protection.

* **Access:** *Promoting* **online safety** and attention to child on line protection.
* **CDT**: *Promoting online safety* and attention to child on line protection.
* **GPD**: *Promoting* **online safety** and attention to child on line protection.
* **USA**: *Promoting a culture of* **Cybersecurity** and encouraging attention to child on line protection.
* **Sweden**: Deleted
* **Russia**: *Promoting* **security** and protection of children on line..

1. **Egypt***: Encouraging international, regional and national cybersecuirty strategies to protect both users and national security.*
2. **Egypt*:*** Highlighting the importance and role of **National Centers for Warning and Management of IT Incidents Exchange and Personal Data protection** in Cloud computing.
3. **UNESCO**: *Build capacities of all citizens on* ***media and information literacy***

* **Broadband:**

**GDP:** Could be grouped under ‘bridging the digital divide’

1. Provision of **affordable access to broadband and networks and services** for all citizens worldwide to ensure inclusiveness, social and geographical equity;

* **Access**: Provision of **affordable access to broadband and networks and services** for all people to ensure inclusiveness, social and geographical equity;
* **CDT**: Provision of **affordable access to broadband and networks and services** for all citizens to ensure inclusiveness, social and geographical equity;
* **USA**: Provision of **affordable access to broadband and networks and services** for all citizens worldwide to promote inclusiveness, social and geographical equity;

1. Developing and advancing broadbandnetwork that supports the **economic growth of the country and facilitate the utilization of ICT tools** by the citizens.
2. *Providing* **developing countries with assistance in rolling out broadband infrastructure and Internet Exchange Points** – which will enable more local content and local e-Services to be provided in those countries.

* **USA**: *Providing* **developing countries with assistance and expanding broadband infrastructure, including Internet Exchange Points** – which will enable more local content and local e-Services to be provided in those countries.
* **Russia:** *Providing assistance* todeveloping countries in establishing **Internet Exchange Points** to improve the quality, increase the connectivity and resilience of networks, foster competition and reduce the costs of interconnections, which will also enable more local content and local e-Services to be provided in those countries.

1. Providing assistance for those countries that would like to embrace appropriate **regulatory regimes for their domestic telecoms/ ICT markets** in the future.

* Providing assistance for those countries that would like to adoptlegal frameworks to promote **their domestic telecoms/ ICT markets**.

1. **Using** **social networks in e-government**

* **UK: Deleted**
* **Sweden: Deleted**
* **Russia:Deleted**

1. Focusing on **ICT professionalism** in the period 2015 and beyond. The extent to which ICT is embedded in our lives is inevitably growing. If we fail to take steps to mature the ICT profession, it is likely that the risks to society from ICT will grow.

* **UK**: Focusing on fostering ICT skills to help generate jobs and allow more people to benefit from the Information Society. **ICT professionalism** in the period 2015 and beyond, ensuring that professional expertise keeps pace with advancing technology. access to ICT skillswill not be able to take full advantage of the opportunities presented by services
* **Egypt**: This fits more in the introduction rather than a priority.
* **CDT**: Encouraging ICT capacity building and building mechanisms for ICT skills development.
* **USA**: Focusing on **ICT professionalism** in the period 2015 and beyond. The extent to which ICT is embedded in our lives is inevitably growing; therefore we should take steps to mature the ICT profession.
* **Russia**: Focusing on **ICT professionalism** in the period 2015 and beyond.
* GESCI: ICT professionalism for the public sector is particularly critical to African social and economic development. Policy makers and implementers across key ministries need to fully understand the ICT environment, including telecommunications, broadband, infrastructure, e-governance etc. in order to create policies that will accelerate Africa’s social and economic development.

1. Addressing **e-environment** issues and challenges, developing of Green IT and using ICT to combat climate change.
2. Integrating ICT with **educational initiatives** and activities.

* **IFLA**: There is not enough in this document about the importance of digital literacies, media and information literacy etc
* GESCI: Education is not sufficiently addressed in existing action lines. Without a relevantly educated labour force, especially in developing countries, inclusive growth is impossible and inequality will continue to spiral out of control, creating unrest and limiting the contribution developing countries can make to global trade. Teachers must be a priority for ICT in Education policies and directives in developing countries. Without well trained ICT literate and ICT confident teachers the education system will continue to deliver a poor quality of education to the majority of the world’s poor. Make teacher education, training and professional development a WSIS priority.

1. Exploring mechanisms for accreditation of **on-line learning.**

* **Egypt: Deleted.**

1. *Implementation* of practical mechanisms to support **e-Science** related recommendations of the WSIS +10 Review process at the national, regional and global level. This includes funding modalities and financial support.

* **Japan**: *Implementation* of practical mechanisms to support **e-Science** related recommendations of the WSIS +10 Review process at the national, regional and global level.
* **ISOC**: *Suport* **e-Science** at the national, regional and global level. This includes funding modalities and financial support.
* **Russia**: *Implementation* of practical mechanisms to support **e-Science** at the national, regional and global level. This includes funding modalities and financial support.

1. *Inclusion* of **Indigenous Peoples,** who are a marginalized group, should be prioritized across all the action lines (for instance, e-learning, media, access are all of great importance to Indigenous Peoples). A separate action line focusing specifically on inclusivity of Indigenous Peoples would highlight this important issue.

* **GPD**: Could be grouped under accessibility for vulnerable populations
* **Russia:** *Inclusion* of **Indigenous Peoples,** who are a marginalized group, should be prioritized across all the action lines (for instance, access to e-learning, media are all of greater importance to Indigenous Peoples). A separate action line focusing specifically on inclusivity of Indigenous Peoples would highlight this important issue

1. *Russia*: Inclusion of vulnerable social groups - people with disabilities, elderly, refugees, migrants, etc. who must have a variety of opportunities to strengthen their social position through ICTs and e-services. This should be also regarded as **a standalone goal** and action line
2. Addressing the issue of **affordable access**.

* **Access**: There are many points relating to affordable access here. Recommend streamlining.
* **GPD**: Could be grouped under bridging the digital divide// access
* **Russia**: Delete

1. *Encouraging* the full deployment of **IPv6 and IPv4**.

* **Egypt**: Could be moved under internet
* **ISOC**: *Encouraging* the full deployment of **IPv6 to ensure the long-term sustainability of the addressing space**.
* **USA***: Encouraging* the full deployment of **IPv6**.
* **Russia**: Delete

1. *Deploying* of e**-services to marginalized and disadvantaged** members of society.

* **GPD**:Repetitive, could be grouped with accessibility for vulnerable populations

1. Addressing **ethical issues related to emerging technologies** and the information society.

* **Egypt**: This is redundancy from the previous mentioned point of the online code of conducts
* **Access**: Unclear what is meant here.
* **CDT**:
* **Sweden: Deleted**

1. *Developing* **agreed goals and time-based targets** along with enhanced monitoring and reporting.

* **ISOC**: This could create confusion given one of the principles of this exercise, which is to avoid talking about new WSIS targets at this stage.

1. **Egypt**: Developing **convergence** between broadcasting and mobile services
2. **Egypt**: Pushing forward the **transition** from analogue to digital terrestrial broadcasting
3. *Making* efforts towards **developing the content industry** to meet the diversity in cultural and religious aspects, and be in accordance with the WSIS target to assure on the multilingualism aspect.

* **ISOC**: *Encouraging* efforts towards **developing local and diverse content**, and further meet the WSIS target to promote multilingualism.

1. **Social Networking and Freedom of Expression** are vital for WSIS beyond 2015 to guarantee adopting the policies and strategies for access and openness for the different actors to be engaged in those tools.

* **UK**: **Freedom of Expression and Association** are vital for WSIS beyond 2015 to guarantee adopting the policies and strategies for access and openness for the different actors to be engaged in those tools.
* **Egypt**: To be moved under either human rights or internet
* **GPD**:Social **Networking and Freedom of Expression** are vital for WSIS beyond 2015 or its equivalent framework to guarantee adopting the policies and strategies for access and openness for the different actors to be engaged in those tools.
* **Iran**: Note: We have concern and comment in this matter which provide later.
* **Russia**: **Social Networking and Freedom of Expression** are important to guarantee adopting the policies and strategies for access and openness for the different actors to be engaged in those tools.

1. *Promoting* the use of **ICT for Democracy**

* **Iran:** Note : This matter should not confide the ICT development in some parts of the world and should not a be used by some countries against the others according their political conflict.So We have concern and comment in this matter which provide later.
* **Russia:** full participation in society" instead of "Democracy". As these documents are universal and aimed at countries with all forms of government (not obligatorily democratic) this formula should be politically accurate

1. *Promoting* **Access for All;** Access to information and knowledge

* **Egypt:** This is covered before and under the human rights and internet
* **GPD**: Repetitive, could be grouped under access// bridging the digital divide

1. *Prioritizing* on how all stakeholders can **build on existing expertise and best-practice** solutions.

* **UK**:Prioritizing the sharing of **existing expertise and best-practice** solutions. between all stakeholders.
* **IFIP**: NOTE THIS SEEMS TO BE RELATED TO A SIMILAR NOTE AT THE FOOT OF THE PREVIOUS PAGE

1. ***Connecting* the unconnected** especially people with disability

* **Egypt**: Redundant
* **GPD**: Repetitive, could be grouped with accessibility for vulnerable populations
* **GESCI**: Rural poor should be a focus

1. ***Generating* trust** in the use of ICTs should be deemed a priority. Generating guarantees regarding topics such as personal data protection and cyber security is critical.

* **Egypt**: Redundant
* **IFIP**: NOTE THIS TOO SEEMS TO BE RELATED TO SEVERAL OTHERS IN THIS DOCUMENT
* **USA**: Delete
* **Russia:** Delete

1. *Assuring* the **quality of e-services.**

* **ISOC:** *Encouraging* the **quality of e-services.**
* **UK**:Continuing *development of* **quality e-services.**
* **Egypt**: Redundant

1. *Highlighting* **network traffic management.**

* **Egypt**: Redundant
* **CDT**:
* **USA: Delete**

1. *Ensuring* **Network neutrality**.

* **Egypt**: Redundant
* **ISOC**: *Furthering the dialogue on* **Network neutrality**.
* **USA**: Delete

1. *Protection* of **data and network users**.

* **Egypt**: Redundant
* **GPD**: Repetitive, could be grouped under ‘privacy and data protection’

1. Highlighting the importance and role of **National Centers for Warning and Management of IT Incidents Exchange and Personal Data protection** in Cloud computing.

* **Egypt**: Moved up
* **CDT**: Highlighting the importance and role of **National Centers for Warning and Management of IT Incidents Exchange and Personal Data protection** in Cloud computing.

1. Creating **replicable and sustainable** ICT projects.