FINISHED TRANSCRIPT

WORLD TELECOMMUNICATION STANDARDIZATION ASSEMBLY

DUBAI, UNITED ARAB EMIRATES

SIXTH PLENARY MEETING

28 NOVEMBER 2012

18:30

Services provided by:

Caption First, Inc.

P.O. Box 3066

Monument, CO 80132

1-877-825-5234

+001-719-481-9835

[www.captionfirst.com](http://www.captionfirst.com)

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

This text is being provided in a roughly edited format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

>> REINHARD SCHOLL: Ladies and gentlemen, we're going to start.

>> CHAIR: We'll come back, ladies and gentlemen, to this evening session of the Plenary. I would like to bring to your attention the revised agenda for the remaining of the meeting. It's in document 33, Rev 3. I hope everyone has it now. It's available online. And it's been presented on the screens now.

So before we proceed with the ‑‑ has everyone got a copy of the agenda now and it's available online. The first item on the agenda is continuation of the work we had before the break. We've finalized almost all aspects of document 113, and I was just about to announce that the Plenary approves document 113, with all the proposals made by the Chairman and some of the modifications that have been proposed, and some of the statements that will be reflected in the Chairman's report and the report of the Plenary.

So if the Plenary has no further comments on document 113, I would like to announce it approved. I see no further requests for the floor. Thank you very much. Then the document 113 as presented by Chairman of Committee 4 with proposals to make modifications and changes to the Resolution J‑1 is approved. Thank you.

Yes, Iran, please.

>> IRAN: Thank you, Chairman. Having approved this document and closing the matter, I just wish to bring to your kind attention the issue that we raised at the meeting of Heads of Delegation. According to discussions at the Ad Hoc Group of Committee it was felt appropriate that the Chairman of this group, or this Committee, be included in the management team of TSAG in order to maintain and establish communication, appropriate communications, between the TSAG and this Review Committee, and I think Mr. Johnson also was in favor of that issue when we discussed it at the Review Committee. Whether there is other arrangement but just as matter of clarifications, the people felt appropriate that this issue be discussed. Thank you.

>> CHAIR: Yes, thank you, Iran. Yes indeed, this discussion was brought up in the Heads of Delegation meeting, and it was highlighted that it would be appropriate to ‑‑ it was appropriate to include them in the management of the ‑‑ for the purpose of coordination, proper coordination with TSAG, and the proposal is both forwarded to the Plenary and is noted and will be reflected, as well. Thank you.

Our next Agenda Item is Item Number 2, and that's document number 105. It's the set of Resolutions that are sent directly to the Plenary and haven't passed to the Editorial Committee and we would like to ask the Chairman of Committee 4 please to present the document. Thank you.

>> YOICHI MAEDA: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. This is another set of series of text submitted by Committee 4 to the Editorial Committees, and I think you have the long list, and first four Resolutions has been already approved in your former Plenaries, and remaining Resolutions to be approved in this Plenary are Resolution 52, 58, 60, 61, 65, 69, and 75. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

>> CHAIR: Thank you, Mr. Maeda. It's also to highlight Resolutions 20, 29, 40, and 50 presented in document 105 will be discussed under document 115 at the next Agenda Item.

So for the purpose of approval of this document, we're only going to consider as Mr. Maeda highlighted Resolutions number 52, 58, 60, 61, 65, 69, and 75.

With that in mind, would you please turn to the Resolution Number 52 of the document 105. If you have any comments or clarification of the Resolution. I see none. Thank you. Resolution 52, countering and combating spam, is approved.

Our next item is Resolution 58, encourage the creation of National Computer Incident Response Teams, particularly for developing countries. Do you have any comments on this Resolution? I see none, so this Resolution is approved by the Plenary. Thank you.

Our next item is Resolution 60, responding to the challenges of the evolution of the identification/numbering system and its convergence with IP‑based systems/networks. Do we have any comments? Thank you, I see none. Resolution 60 is approved by the Plenary.

Next is Resolution 61, countering and combating misappropriation and misuse of international telecommunication numbering resources. The Resolution is presented for your approval. I see no comments. Thank you. Resolution 61 is approved by the Plenary.

Our next item is Resolution 65, calling party number delivery, Calling Line Identification and Origin Identification. This Resolution is presented for your approval, please. I see no comments, thank you. Resolution 65 is approved by the Plenary. .

Our next item is Resolution 69, non‑discriminatory access and use of Internet resources. The document is presented for your approval, please. I see no comments, thank you. Resolution 69 is approved by the Plenary.

Finally, our last Resolution in document 105 is Resolution 75, ITU‑T's contribution in implementing the outcomes of the World Summit on the Information Society. The Resolution is presented for your approval. I see no comments. Resolution 75 is approved by the Plenary. Thank you.

That concludes the list of Resolutions presented to the Plenary through document 105. I would like now to call on the Chairman of Committee 5 to present document 115, please.

>> MARIE THÉRÈSE ALAJOUANINE: Thank you, Chairman. The drafting Committee presents for the approval of the Plenary document 115. This contains four Resolutions. They've been revised. And they were submitted by Committee 4. Resolutions 20, 29, 40, and 50. Thank you, Chairman.

>> CHAIR: Thank you, Madam. So the document in front of us, 115, represents four Resolutions submitted by Committee 4 for approval of the Plenary.

We'll start with Resolution Number 20. Iran, please, you the floor.

>> IRAN: Through, Chairman. Very small editorial in the document. It said that for the first reading. This is for a PP conference. We don't need for the first reading. Thank you.

>> CHAIR: Thank you, Iran. We'll do the editorial change. We'll move now to Resolution Number 20, please. Do we have any comments on Resolution 20? I see none. Resolution 20 is approved by the Plenary. Thank you.

Let's move now to Resolution Number 29, alternative calling procedures on international telecommunication networks. I see no comments. Resolution 29 is approved by the Plenary. Thank you.

Our next item is Resolution Number 40, regulatory aspects of ITU‑T work. Are there any comments? I see none, thank you. Resolution Number 40 is approved by the Plenary.

Our last item on this document is Resolution Number 50, cybersecurity. Any comments? I see none, thank you. Resolution Number 50 is approved by the Plenary.

That concludes the set of Resolutions presented in document 115. We'll move now to Agenda Item 4, the approval of suppression of Resolutions 17, 26, and 56. We do not have any documents or presentation. However, these were recommended by Chairman of Committee 4 for suppression, so if we move to item 4.59, the suppression of Resolution 17, Telecommunication and standardization in relation to the interests of developing countries. The Plenary approves the suppression of this Resolution? Do we have any comments? Thank you, I see none. So the Plenary approves the suppression of Resolution 17.

With regards to suppression of Resolution 26, assistance to Regional Groups of Study Group 3, are there any views or objection to the suppression of Resolution 26? I see none. Thank you. The Plenary approves the suppression of Resolution 26.

And finally the suppression of Resolution 56, roles of TSAG and ITU‑T Study Group Vice‑Chairmen from developing countries. I see no comments, thank you. The Plenary approves the suppression of Resolution 56. Thank you.

Our next item is the Draft New Resolution on e‑health, and we believe that there's been discussion and a compromise has been reached. I would like to call the Chairman of Committee 4 to walk us through the compromise that has reached. Would you please enlighten us on what you've been discussing and what is the outcome? Thank you.

>> YOICHI MAEDA: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I'm very glad to report now agreement on Draft New Resolution on e‑health in the drafting session. Please find the document. I heard that TSB can display on the screen. Thank you very much.

So the document which you can see on the screen is a compromise text as developed in the drafting group that met twice in this morning and lunchtime. So as a summary of our modification, changes, to the draft Resolution, we have discussed three parts of the existing text to modify, and three parts ‑‑ first part is resolve to instruct the Director of the Telecommunication Standardization Bureau in consultation with the Director of the Telecommunication Development Bureau, that part has been modified, including the Director of the related Bureau, and first part of that instruct to the TSB Director has been modified, as you can see.

Second part modification is on the next page. It's the part of "instructs Study Group 16, in collaboration with relevant Study Groups, particularly Study Group 11 and 17," and Section 4, item 4, of that instruct Study Groups, fourth item has been modified. And fourth part is modification to the part of "invites Member States."

In the modification process, we have deleted some text and those deletion of some text result in creation of the new recognizing part. So back to the introductory part, before the instruct the Director of TSB, we have added new recognizing. One is importance of safeguarding patients' right and privacy.

Second recognizing item is the National, legislative and regulatory discussion relating to e‑health and e‑health applications, and that this is an area of the rapid evolution.

So as a summary, we made three parts for modification, and two items are added for the "recognizing." That's a result of our drafting group, and I hope this give you a good compromise solution. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

>> CHAIR: Thank you, Mr. Maeda. And thanks to all who participated into reaching this consensus at this late time of the evening, and thanks for the efforts made to come up with this document.

United Arab Emirates, you have the floor, please.

>> UNITED ARAB EMIRATES: Thank you very much, Chairman. I take the floor specifically to thank the Chair of Committee 4 and all participants in the drafting Committee or drafting group, for their understanding, for their cooperation, in order to achieve a new text that was presented by the Arab group. My sincere thanks to all of them. Thank you.

>> CHAIR: Thank you, United Arab Emirates. Yes, thanks indeed to all who have participated in coming up with this document. I do understand that great effort has been made to come up with this delicate compromise, so the document is presented in front of us for approval on the draft Resolution ARB‑1 with regards to the Information and Communication Technology applications and standards with access to e‑health services. The document is forwarded to us for the approval. Thank you. This Draft New Resolution is approved by the Plenary. Thank you.

Our next Agenda Item, number 6, the document is not yet ready so we'll have to postpone it for tomorrow. I believe the same applies to Agenda Item 7, document number 116, which is not yet available, as well. So we'll be obliged to take that tomorrow, as well. If you allow me, I'd like to move to Agenda Item Number 8, the and document 118 which was available today and would like to call the Chairman of Committee 2 to walk us through the report, please.

>> KYU‑JIN WEE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Document 118 is the report of Committee 2. We met three times and we considered several items as mandated by the Plenary. Among others, I would like to highlight several points at this stage. First is Section 3, agreement between the Government of the United Arab Emirates and the ITU. We reviewed the contract, and the budget contract Committee wanted me to thank the Government of the United Arab Emirates for the excellent organisation and facilities provided for this Assembly.

In Section 4, we noted our one of the mandates, which is according to the Article 18 of the Constitution, and then also at the relevant provisions. After that, the Committee 2 issued two documents to the Committee 3 chairs and the Committee 4 Chairs. And I will detail explain later.

In Section 5, we reviewed any members or organisations who has to defray the cost according to our rules, and then we have listed the two organisations, which is the non‑exempted Sector Members, so we list, and I believe that those Sector Members will defray for the cost of the Assembly.

And then next Section, Section 6, we reviewed the budget of this Assembly, and then in the second paragraph under Section 6, the estimated expenditures as at the 26 November, indicates an amount of 170 kilo Swiss francs of unused appropriations, excluding documentation costs. An excess of the expenditure of 120 kilo Swiss franc is focused for the cost of documentation due to the higher volume than planned. Total costs including documentation are expected to be 50 kilo Swiss francs, but it has been below the budget. So I provide Annex on this matters in detail.

In Section 7, we reviewed estimated financial needs up to the next Assembly, and ITU‑T expenditure for the year 2008 to year 2012. During the consideration of this matter, we have just some comments. First one is from Canada that says the importance to avoid the duplications and optimize the use of the resources of the Union. One example was pointed out that any capacity building initiatives and other activities of the ITU‑T in relation to the Resolution 44 on Bridging the Standardization Gap between developing and developed countries have to be closely monitored and coordinated with the development Sector ITU‑D.

Also, we were advised that from the Chairman of the TSAG, the last year for the WTSA TSAG meeting date was not enough, and then in future, TSAG may need some flexibility to increase the meeting date to cover those issues related to the WTSA preparations and those view also was supported by the German Delegations.

And then Section 8, already in the morning, Mr. Chairman, you approved proposed modification on Resolution 34, so I may skip this part, because you already approved these modifications.

The Section 9, we also reviewed any financial implication from the decision of the Assembly, and then we analyzed based on the information from the other Committee, Committee 3 and Committee 4, which I provided in Annex B, so in accordance with Council Resolutions, this information need to be carried forward to the Council, including any comments from the Plenary.

And then we also had the view from financial resource management Department that it will be difficult to balance the year 2014 to year 2015 budget with these additions and Resolutions that requires additional financial findings.

Also, TSB Director indicated several comments, and then one of them I quoted those comments in my meeting report in Section 9.

Finally, in Section 10, I would ask you to consider this one, this report, and approve this report. Then it will be forwarded by the Secretary‑General, together with the comments of this Plenary, for the submission of the Councils. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

>> CHAIR: Thank you, Mr. Wee. And thanks to the work of Committee 2 and your colleagues who contributed to that work.

I've noticed some square brackets in the Annex B and some of the square brackets in the attachment the cost assessment. I believe they are editorial because they refer to some of the Resolutions that had not been discussed by the time the report was submitted. Is that the case, Mr. Wee?

>> KYU-JIN WEE: Yes, you're right. Thank you.

>> CHAIR: Thank you. Then those would be subject to the editorial modifications and changes. So the report is presented in front of us from Chairman of Committee 2 for the approval of the Plenary. Do we have any comments on the report? Mr. Zhao, please.

>> HOULIN ZHAO: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. We found that this Committee 2 report is very good summarize of the discussions conducted in Committee 2, and we are very pleased with the result of their discussion. Secretary‑General wish to make two comments here, but unfortunately he's very busy with a conference call with the United States now so he just left. He asked me to convey two of the messages.

One, we appreciate very much Committee 2 Chairman for his attention to the articles 18 of Constitution, paragraph 115, and the Constitution Article 34, paragraph 488 and 489 that he conveyed at the early stage of our conference his message to Chairman of Committee 3 and Committee 4 to ask them to pay attention to those possible financial consequences of Resolutions and decisions that we make.

And we really appreciate that effort. And then we noted that in paragraph 9, Committee 2 did an analysis of the situation and give us a very good analysis that indeed there might be some financial consequences of those Resolutions that will require additional financial resources to support the activities. And as indicated in the discussion that head of ITU's financial resource Department point out that this will affect the preparation of the draft budget for 2014 and 2015 and perhaps you have noted that ITU management started to prepare this draft budget, so that we can present balanced budget to next Council Working Group meeting management, which will be held in the beginning of February, and during that process, we had tremendous difficulties to establish a balanced budget, and with this kind of additional requirement for financial resources, indeed as said in the conference by the head of financial resource Department that we may have difficulties so that one we just try to draw attention to the fact that indeed we have some difficulties, challenges here, and we'd like to encourage you as we did for radio Assembly and WRC that the sectors should try to find additional resources to cover those additional requirements, which may not be there before.

And we're very pleased that the Director of TSB also mentioned that in the meeting so we look for good cooperation from your side.

Of course, during the process, we will try our best to see if we can cover some kind of ‑‑ this kind of requirement, but as far as the financial resources is concerned, it may not be that easy.

Now, second thing Secretary‑General asked me to convey, for all these additional requirements which requires additional resources he would like to highlight that the close cooperate with the BDT, with the development Sector, is absolutely important. With that kind of vote maybe we could make best use of those resources available to us, and he also ask me to convey his personal opinion that this may not only affect the budget for 2014‑2015, may have even further consequence to the future budget.

So that we would like to draw the attention of this conference to this point. Thank you very much, Mr. Chairman.

>> CHAIR: There, Mr. Zhao. Director of BDT? Sorry, TSB. The discussion was about you, too.

>> MALCOLM JOHNSON: Yes, thank you, Chairman. And further to Deputy Secretary‑General's remarks, I'd also like to emphasize again what I stated during the Committee 2 meeting, that despite making every effort to improve the cost efficiency of the work in the TSB and the ITU‑T, due to the substantially increased extent of the work in the T Sector, and the greatly increased participation in the T Sector, it's been very difficult to complete the work programme for 2012 within the current budgetary allocation for the T Sector.

In fact, it wouldn't have been possible except for the fact we were able to draw on some voluntary contribution to the TSB that had been made earlier. And of course, we also have the Bridging the Standards Gap Fund which has been supported for some years now by just four contributors, Korean Communications Commission, Microsoft, Cisco, and NSN. And despite pleas for further contributions to this fund, we've only recently received an additional contribution, I'm pleased to say, from Canada. So very grateful for that additional contribution.

So we had a lot of extra work given to us in Johannesburg, and we have a lot more work coming to us from the decisions taken at this Assembly. So I'd like to again make a plea to members and Sector Members to consider providing voluntary funding to the work of the TSB.

I'd also like to emphasize once again, because I know it's a concern of the membership about the duplication of work between the sectors and the Bureaux, that we are enjoying excellent collaboration with the other two sectors and the other two Bureaux, especially the Development Bureau, as I mentioned at the beginning of the Assembly, when the Director of the BDT was sitting next to me. We enjoy very good collaboration in implementing many of the actions placed upon us, especially the conformity and interoperability programme.

And we established a number of internal Task Forces to ensure that we don't duplicate effort in any way, and especially on the workshops. We have an internal Task Force between the three sectors to make sure that there's no duplication, and all three sectors can contribute to the workshops, which we now call ITU workshops. We don't have ITU‑T workshops, ITU‑D workshops, or ITU‑R workshops anymore.

The Director of the BDT and the Director of the BR agreed with me that we should have close collaboration on all these workshops, and it's working very well. So I can assure you, we make every effort we can from the three sectors to ensure that there is no duplication of effort, given our very limited resources. Thank you, Chairman.

>> CHAIR: Thank you, Mr. Johnson, Director of TSB. I apologize for the mistake.

So with that in mind, ladies and gentlemen, we have the report of Committee 2 Chairman in front of us for approval. I would like to thank Mr. Wee for his work and the work of his colleagues in Committee 2. It was a very challenging work, I understand, because of the coordination, the extensive coordination needed with Committee 4 Chairman and Committee 3, due to the large number of Resolutions which were requesting additional work on the TSB. So an excellent coordination work has been provided which results in the report in front of us. So if we have no further comments on the report, I would like to say the Plenary approves the report I would like to see if the Plenary accepts the report, with the editorial changes that will be made later. I see no requests from the floor, so the report of Committee 2 is approved. Thank you.

That brings us to the end of today's meeting apparently because the rest of the documents are yet to be presented, as well. So if we don't have any other business for today's meeting, we've finished quite earlier than expected, or planned initially. We shall resume tomorrow morning at 9:30 with the Plenary and the continuation of the documents which we did not have in hand, specifically document 109 and 116, which hopefully will be available by tomorrow morning.

And then we'll discuss the appointment of Chairmen and Vice‑Chairmen of Study Groups, TSAG and the Regional Groups and the Review Committee, and it will be presented in the document to the Plenary.

Is there any item that anyone would like to discuss under any other business for tonight? Okay, I see no requests for the floor. Thank you very much for your patience, and for the efforts made so far.

Thank you, interpreters, for staying with us until late tonight. We look forward to see you tomorrow morning at 9:30. This meeting is adjourned. Thank you.

[ End of meeting ]

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

This text is being provided in a roughly edited format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*