|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | INTERNATIONAL TELECOMMUNICATION UNION  **TELECOMMUNICATION STANDARDIZATION SECTOR**  STUDY PERIOD 2022-2024 | | | | TSAG-TD245R1 |
| TSAG |
| Original: English |
| **Question(s):** | | | RG-WM | | Geneva, 30 May – 2 June 2023 |
| **TD** | | | | | |
| **Source:** | | | Rapporteur, TSAG Rapporteur group on working methods | | |
| **Title:** | | | Working document to support the discussion on TD243 (LS/I on SCV activity in SG2) | | |
| **Contact:** | | Olivier Dubuisson  Orange France | | Tel: +33 6 74 95 46 37 E-mail: [olivier.dubuisson@orange.com](mailto:olivier.dubuisson@orange.com) | |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Abstract:** | This TD is a first analysis by the rapporteur (in collaboration with TSB editing team) of the items in TD243 which are relevant to RG-WM. |

**Action required**:RG-WM is invited to discuss this document.

|  |
| --- |
| **1**. The status of definitions developed in informal ITU‑T documents, such as Technical reports, Technical papers, Technical specifications, Supplements, is not quite clear. Mixing terms in the ITU Terms and Definitions database that went through AAP and TAP procedures with terms that have just been agreed in informal documents looks dangerous. SG2 asks TSAG to **evaluate possible issues**, including possible deletion of clause 3.2 (Definitions developed in this text) from informal document templates. |

**Analysis**: Definitions contained in ITU-T informal documents are NOT included in the ITU Terms and Definitions database. This is confirmed by clause 8.3, Note 2, of the [Author's guide for drafting ITU-T Recommendations](https://www.itu.int/oth/T0A0F000004/en):

NOTE 2 – TSB collects all new terms and their definitions from new or revised Recommendations and adds them to the ITU-T Terms and Definitions database, which is available to the general public on the ITU-T website (http://www.itu.int/ITU-R/go/terminology-database).

**Suggested action for RG-WM:** None, otherwise add "only" to clause 8.3, Note 2, of the [Author's guide for drafting ITU-T Recommendations](https://www.itu.int/oth/T0A0F000004/en):

NOTE 2 – TSB collects all new terms and their definitions only from new or revised Recommendations, and adds them to the ITU-T Terms and Definitions database, which is available to the general public on the ITU-T website (<http://www.itu.int/ITU-R/go/terminology-database>).

|  |
| --- |
| **3**. Working with definition of *Asset* we found out that it was copy-pasted from ISO/IEC 27000:2009 in some ITU-T Recommendations with reference to it, but versions of ISO/IEC 27000:2016 and 2018 (the last one) do not have it at all. It shows us issues that we cannot resolve in a fast way. One proposal could be as much as possible to avoid using definitions from outside sources. SG2 asks TSAG to **evaluate this issue** and amend the Author’s Guide and maybe some Recommendations of A-series if needed. |

**Analysis:** There are two possible cases as mentioned in clause 8.3, Note 1, of the [Author's guide for drafting ITU‑T Recommendations](https://www.itu.int/oth/T0A0F000004/en):

NOTE 1 – [*Case 1:*] Terms which are defined elsewhere should normally include only a normative reference to the defining document to avoid difficulty in keeping multiple copies of a definition aligned. [*Case 2:*] In exceptional circumstances, a definition for a term defined elsewhere may be quoted with an informative reference to the source document in order to allow for a stand-alone document.

*Case 1*: The definition is not copied from the reference document, only the normative reference to the document is mentioned after the term.

|  |
| --- |
| **3** **Definitions**  **3.1** **Terms defined elsewhere**  This Recommendation uses the following terms defined elsewhere:  **3.1.1** **term-1** [normative-ref-1]. |

In this case, if the definition is no longer in the reference document, it is suggested to revise the ITU‑T Recommendation by inserting the definition after the term, removing the normative reference and moving the whole line from clause 3.1 "Terms defined elsewhere" to clause 3.2 "Terms defined in this Recommendation":

|  |
| --- |
| **3** **Definitions**  **3.2** **Terms defined in this Recommendation**  This Recommendation defines the following terms:  **3.2.1** **term-1**: Definition. |

*Case 2*: The definition is copied from the source document and a bibliographic reference is mentioned after the term being defined:

|  |
| --- |
| **3** **Definitions**  **3.1** **Terms defined elsewhere**  This Recommendation uses the following terms defined elsewhere:  **3.1.1** **term-1** [b-bibliographic-ref-1]: Definition. |

Obviously, the definition is part of the ITU-T Recommendation. If the reference document is no longer available, three purely editorial solutions exist:

*a.* Identify whether the organization that defined the term has moved the definition to a different document. If the definition has been moved, the solution is to update the bibliographic reference:

|  |
| --- |
| **3** **Definitions**  **3.1** **Terms defined elsewhere**  This Recommendation uses the following terms defined elsewhere:  **3.1.1** **term-1** [b-bibliographic-ref-2]: Definition. |

*b*. If the definition is not found in an external document, the bibliographic reference [b‑bibliographic-ref-1] is deleted and the whole line is moved from clause 3.1 to clause 3.2:

|  |
| --- |
| **3** **Definitions**  **3.2** **Terms defined in this Recommendation**  This Recommendation defines the following terms:  **3.2.1** **term-1**: Definition. |

*c*. The bibliographic reference is kept for the purpose of tracking the history (it is not an issue that a bibliographic reference is outdated or not available anymore):

|  |
| --- |
| **3** **Definitions**  **3.1** **Terms defined elsewhere**  This Recommendation uses the following terms defined elsewhere:  **3.1.1** **term-1** [b-bibliographic-ref-1]: Definition. |

In the case being addressed by ITU-T SG2, the definition for 'Asset' is given in ITU-T X.1211 as:

|  |
| --- |
| **3** **Definitions**  **3.1** **Terms defined elsewhere**  This Recommendation uses the following terms defined elsewhere:  **3.1.1** **asset** [b-ISO/IEC 27000:2014]: Anything that has value to the organization. |

and the concern is that the definition is no longer contained in ISO/IEC 27000:2018, the latest edition of the international standard.

In this case, and in accordance with the above, it would be suggested that one of the solutions to case 2 be applied. It should be noted that ISO/IEC provides a slightly modified definition of 'asset' in ISO/IEC 20924:2018, which favours case 2 solution *a* as described above.

**Suggested action for RG-WM:** None (the suggested solutions mentioned above are already allowed by the [Author's guide for drafting ITU‑T Recommendations](https://www.itu.int/oth/T0A0F000004/en)).

|  |
| --- |
| **4**. Working with many definitions from **IEEE** for possible inclusion in the new ITU-T Recommendations developed in SG2, SG2 sent a Liaison Statement to IEEE requesting permission to copy paste in ITU-T Recommendations under ITU-T IPR Policy rules. SG2 will inform you about results of this request. |

**Analysis:** Study Group 2 should be commended for this action as study groups often forget to check that the outside organization from which definitions are copied agrees to their inclusion[[1]](#footnote-2) in an ITU‑T Recommendation. It is the responsibility of the editor of the draft ITU-T Recommendation (under the responsibility of the rapporteur) to check that the outside organization agrees to inclusion of its definitions. Such an agreement already exists with ISO and IEC.

**Suggested action for RG-WM:** Amend clause 8.3, Note 1 (and possibly rise the level to normal text), of the [Author's guide for drafting ITU‑T Recommendations](https://www.itu.int/oth/T0A0F000004/en) as follows:

NOTE 1 – Terms which are defined elsewhere should normally include only a normative reference to the defining document to avoid difficulty in keeping multiple copies of a definition aligned. In exceptional circumstances, to allow for a stand-alone document, a definition for a term defined elsewhere may be quoted with an informative reference to the source document, provided the necessary copyright clearance has been obtained from the copyright holder.

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

1. The process is somewhat equivalent to the incorporation of a text "in part, without modification" according to Recommendation ITU-T A.25. Although it is not suggested to go as far as requesting an A.25 justification when a definition is copied, clauses 6.2 "Permission arrangements" and 6.3 "Copyright arrangements" of Rec. ITU-T A.25 are (partly) relevant. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)