|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | INTERNATIONAL TELECOMMUNICATION UNION  **TELECOMMUNICATION STANDARDIZATION SECTOR**  STUDY PERIOD 2022-2024 | | | | TSAG-TD184 |
| TSAG |
| Original: English |
| **Question(s):** | | | RG-WM | | Geneva, 30 May – 2 June 2023 |
| **TD** | | | | | |
| **Source:** | | | Rapporteur, TSAG Rapporteur group on working methods | | |
| **Title:** | | | Draft Report of the meeting of RG-WM "Working methods" (Geneva, 30 May, 31 May and 1 June 2023) | | |
| **Contact:** | | Olivier Dubuisson  Orange France | | E-mail: [olivier.dubuisson@orange.com](mailto:olivier.dubuisson@orange.com) | |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Abstract:** | This TD provides the draft report for the RG-WM sessions (30 May, 31 May and 1 June 2023) during the TSAG plenary meeting. |

**Action required**: TSAG/WP1 is invited to consider the following actions and to approve this report from RG-WM.

|  |
| --- |
| **Actions for WP1:**  - TBD |

**TUESDAY, 30 May 2023**

**1 Opening and welcome**

The meeting was chaired by Mr Olivier Dubuisson, Rapporteur of TSAG RG-WM, with the assistance of Mr Philip Rushton, Associate Rapporteur of TSAG RG-WM on e-meetings, and Mr Stefano Polidori, TSB Counsellor.

The meeting opened on 30 May at 16h15. The Chair welcomed the participants and mentioned that, with regard to the agenda found in TD183R1, the documents between parentheses (…) were not meant to be presented but the meeting would do so if requested. Also, the chair mentioned that in some cases, detailed discussion will occur during ad hoc group sessions or future interim rapporteur group meetings. The chair also encouraged all delegates to give short intervention and respect a maximum time of two minutes when taking the floor.

The following documents were noted by the meeting:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1.1 | TSB: TSAG interactive remote participation guidelines – Zoom Multilingual | [[TD](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0054/en)223](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0223) | To be **considered by remote participants**. |
| 1.2 | Supplement 4 to the ITU-T A-series "Supplement on guidelines for remote participation" | [A Suppl.4](https://www.itu.int/ITU-T/recommendations/rec.aspx?rec=15253) | To be **considered by remote participants**. |

**2 Agenda**

The agenda of the RG-WM meeting was adopted as found in TD183R1 with no changes:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 2.1 | Rapporteur, TSAG RG-WM: Draft agenda | [TD183](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0181)R1 (this document) | RG-WM is invited to **adopt** this agenda. |

The following document was noted by the meeting:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 2.2 | Chairman, TSAG: Document allocation and work plan | ([[TD](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-221212-TD-GEN-0002/en)171R2](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0171)) ([TD170R5](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0170)) | To be **noted**. Documents relevant to RG‑WM are listed in this agenda. |

**3 Progress report of interim rapporteur group meetings**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3.1 | Rapporteur, TSAG RG-WM: Progress report from interim TSAG RG-WM meetings | ([TD233](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0233)) | RG-WM is invited to **note** this report (including the RGM reports that it references) which has been approved by the WP1 opening plenary. Each result will be addressed under the corresponding item of this agenda. |

The Chair reminded that TD233 is the progress report of RG-WM to TSAG and details the advancement of the work pertaining to RG-WM since the 12-16 Dec 2022 plenary meeting of TSAG. RG-WM was very proactive and held six interim rapporteur group meetings (RGM) as reported below. The report of each meeting is also linked in the progress report.

• 1 Feb 2023, (Rec. ITU-T A.1) - [DOC4 (230201)](https://extranet.itu.int/meetings/ITU-T/T22-TSAGRGM/RGWM-230201/DOCs/T22-TSAGRGM-RGWM-230201-DOC-0004.docx)

• 14 Feb 2023, (Rec. ITU-T A.7) - [DOC4-R1 (230214)](https://extranet.itu.int/meetings/ITU-T/T22-TSAGRGM/RGWM-230214/DOCs/T22-TSAGRGM-RGWM-230214-DOC-0004-R01.docx)

• 28 Feb 2023, (ITU-T A.8, Suppl A.supplRA & Incubation mechanism) - [DOC9 (230228)](https://extranet.itu.int/meetings/ITU-T/T22-TSAGRGM/RGWM-230228/DOCs/T22-TSAGRGM-RGWM-230228-DOC-0009.docx)

• 18 Apr 2023, (Rec. ITU-T A.7) - [DOC4-R2 (230418)](https://extranet.itu.int/meetings/ITU-T/T22-TSAGRGM/RGWM-230418/DOCs/T22-TSAGRGM-RGWM-230418-DOC-0004-R02.docx)

• 27 Apr 2023, (governance and mgt of meetings with remote participation) - [DOC3 (230427)](https://extranet.itu.int/meetings/ITU-T/T22-TSAGRGM/RGWM-230427/DOCs/T22-TSAGRGM-RGWM-230427-DOC-0003.docx)

• 4 May 2023, (Rec. ITU-T A.1) - [DOC3 (230504)](https://extranet.itu.int/meetings/ITU-T/T22-TSAGRGM/RGWM-230504/DOCs/T22-TSAGRGM-RGWM-230504-DOC-0003.docx)

The RG-WM noted the progress report (including the RGM reports that it references) which has been approved by the WP1 opening plenary. Each result will be addressed under the corresponding item of this agenda.

**4** [**Rec. ITU-T A.1**](https://www.itu.int/ITU-T/A.1) **"Working methods for study groups of the ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector"**

The following documents, which are listed between parentheses, were briefly presented by the Rapporteur and were noted. The Rapporteur clarified that all the proposals in all contributions were inserted in the relevant clauses of TD255R1.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 4.1 | China Telecommunications Corp., Ministry of Industry and Information Technology (MIIT) (China): Proposal for the revised text of Rec. ITU-T A.1 | ([C034](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-C-0034)) | RG-WM has held two interim meetings to discuss the revision of Rec. ITU-T A.1. A couple of urgent tasks were also identified. Recognizing that some key issues remain unresolved, this contribution provides **proposals** for the revision of Rec. ITU‑T A.1.  *Note: The proposals have been included in* [*TD255R1*](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0255)*.* |
| 4.2 | Canada, UK, USA: Resolving issues on remote participation | ([C048](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0048/en)) | This contribution seeks to **provide** clarification on aspects of remote participation that have created issues in recent meetings. A course of action is proposed for TSAG to agree and to progress.  *Note: The proposals have been included in TD255R1 (clauses 1.3.2 and 2.3.3.10).* |
| 4.3 | Canada: International nature of ITU-T standards | ([C028](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-C-0028)) | This contribution **proposes** that TSAG takes into consideration the importance of active support and contribution of international experts from different member states and develop working procedures to ensure that a new work item proposal meets the ITU strategic priorities and international nature of the ITU-T activities before it is approved.  *Note: The proposals have been included in* [*TD255R1*](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0255) *(new clause 1.4.7.1).* |
| 4.4 | USA: Proposed improvements to handling of new work items in study groups | ([C050](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0050/en)) | The processing of new work items within ITU-T study group meetings have dominated the time consumed in the meetings. This has become a detriment to cost-effective meeting management. This contribution **proposes** revisions to the working methods to address this issue.  *Note: The proposals have been included in* [*TD255R1*](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0255) *(clause 1.4.7.1).* |
| 4.5 | China Telecommunications Corp.: Proposal for the terminologies and definitions in Rec. ITU-T A.1 | ([C036](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-C-0036)) | Recognizing that some terminologies and definitions remain with a different understanding, this contribution provides **proposals** for the clarification of "Study Group Meeting" in Rec. ITU-T A.1.  *Note: The proposals have been included in* [*TD255R1*](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0255) *(in particular new clauses 1.8.2.7bis, 1.8.2.7ter, 1.8.2.8bis).* |
| 4.6 | Korea (Republic of): Need for guidance on implementing PP Resolution 208 for non-attendance of chairmen and vice-chairmen at meetings of their respective groups in ITU-T Sector | [C024](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-C-0024) | This contribution suggests that TSAG **considers**:   1. reviewing if there is a need for specific guidance so that necessary actions are implemented consistently to meet the relevant provisions of PP22 Resolution 208, taking into account a relevant provision in WTSA20 Resolution 1; 2. if agreed, to provide that guidance to TSAG, SGs and the TSB Director.   *Note: The proposals have been included in* [*TD255R1*](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0255) *(new clause 2.1.7).* |
| 4.7 | Nokia Corp. (Finland): Proposal regarding "equal treatment" of contributions | ([C026](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-C-0026)) | There are proposed changes to Recommendation ITU-T A.1 concerning "equal treatment" of contributions. This contribution **proposes** to delete those changes, based on there being no practical way to define what "equal treatment" would entail.  *Note: The proposals have been included in* [*TD255R1*](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0255) *(clauses 2.3.3.7 and 3.2.11).* |
| 4.8 | UK: Additional contribution to Rec. ITU-T A.1 | ([C045](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0045/en)) | This contribution **provides** further input on the use of e-mail, both during meetings and between meetings, based on the discussions during the RG-WM meeting on governance and management of e-meetings. It proposes clarification for new text to be inserted into Rec. ITU-T A.1.  *Note: The proposals have been included in* [*TD255R1*](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0255) *(new Annex B).* |
| 4.9 | UK: Further comments on TD255 | ([C044](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0044/en)) | This contribution **provides** additional comments to the content of TSAG-TD255.  The UK supports the editor's **proposal** of a new A-series Recommendation for JCAs (which would be a copy of clause 5 and a reference to this new Recommendation would be added to Rec. ITU-T A.1, clause 2.2). The rapporteur suggests that revised ITU-T A.1 and new ITU-T A.jca would be approved as a package.  *Note: The proposals have been included in* [*TD255R1*](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0255)*.* |
| 4.10 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: Compilation to support the discussion on Rec. ITU-T A.1 "Working methods for study groups of the ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector" | ([TD255R1](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0255)) | This TD is a consolidated revised text that compiles the all WTSA-20 proposals to modify Rec. ITU-T A.1 as well as contributions and discussions at the RG-WM meetings on 1 Feb and 4 May 2023 and contributions to this TSAG meeting.  It has been reviewed until new clause 2.3.3.6 at the 1 Feb and 4 May 2023 interim meetings of RG-WM.  *For* ***discussion*** *at the editing session (concentrating on listed open issues): Wed 31 May, 17:45-19:30.* |

Regarding [C028](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-C-0028), the Rapporteur mentioned that he may have missed on item in TD255R1. If so a revised version will be issued before the editing session.

Russia reserved his position on the process being proposed for the presentation of the contributions.

Contribution C024 was presented by Korea. The contribution proposes to review non-attendance of chairmen and vice-chairmen at meetings of their respective groups in ITU-T. The contribution wishes to understand if there is a need for specific guidance so that necessary actions are implemented consistently to meet the relevant provisions of PP22 Resolution 208, taking into account a relevant provision in WTSA20 Resolution 1.

USA, Russia and Broadcom supported the proposal from Korea. Too many SG vice-chairmen are not attending their meetings and this negligence to fulfil the tasks for which they were appointed should be addressed. The general feeling of the meeting was that it seems important to draft a text to follow up on this contribution and to include it in Rec. ITU-T A.1. It was also suggested that WTSA could issue a guidance for the Plenipotentiary Conference to revise Resolution 208. Korea proposed to draft a text to be reviewed by RG-WM.

TD255R1 is an attempt from the Rapporteur to facilitate discussion on A.1-rev. It is proposed to consider this document as baseline for discussion during an editing session. The editing session will discuss the open issues that are listed on page 2 of TD255R1, which includes a compilation of all proposals received at this meeting as well as the results of the previous interim RG-WM meetings.

* **RG-WM agreed to organize an ad hoc group on ITU-T A.1-rev on Wednesday 31 May, 17:45-19:30.**

**5 Drafting ITU-T Recommendations**

The following documents were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 5.1 | ITU-T Study Group 2: LS/i on SCV activity in SG2 | ([TD243](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0243)) | This liaison statement informs about current terms and definition activities within SG2.  Items 1, 3 and 4 are for **action** by RG-WM. |
| 5.2 | Chairman, Standardization Committee for Vocabulary: Status report of SCV activities | ([TD218](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0218/en)) | "Considering the convenience of using definitions developed by other standards developing organizations (SDOs), and that such practice would help harmonize definitions across all SDOs, the meeting considered suggesting that memoranda of understanding be established with other SDOs to facilitate the inclusion, in ITU-T Recommendations, of definitions developed by the other organizations without the need of requesting explicit copyright clearance for each." |
| 5.3 | TSB: Author's guide for drafting ITU-T Recommendations | ([Author's](https://www.itu.int/oth/T0A0F000004/en) guide) | For **information**. |
| 5.4 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: Working document to support the discussion on TD243 (LS/i on SCV activity in SG2) | ([TD245R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0245)) | *For* ***discussion*** *in the ad hoc group: Thu 1 June, 08:30-09:15.* |

TD245R1 is an attempt from the Rapporteur to facilitate discussion on this issue, especially on items 1, 3 and 4 of TD243, which are for action by RG-WM. It is proposed to consider this document during an ad hoc group.

* **RG-WM agreed to organize an ad hoc group on the Author's guide for drafting ITU-T Recommendations on Thursday 1 June at 08:30-09:15.**

**6 Rec. ITU-T A.4, A.5 and A.6**

The following documents were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 6.1 | Canada, InterDigital Canada Ltee: Proposed way forward for Recs ITU-T A.4, A.5 and A.6 and related qualified organizations | [C029](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-C-0029) | It **is proposed** to update the list of ITU-T A.4 and A.6-qualified organizations, and to verify the needs for them to be ITU-T A.5-qualified. It is **further proposed** to address the overlap between Recs ITU-T A.4 and A.6 in view of the newly created Rec. ITU-T A.25 either by simply suppressing A.4 and A.6, or by merging their information in a new A-series Recommendation complementing Recs ITU-T A.5 and A.25. |
| 6.2 | TSB: Organizations newly qualified for ITU-T A.4, A.5 and A.6 since the last TSAG meeting | ([TD219](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0219/en)) | This TD contains **information** on the decisions taken by ITU-T study groups since the last TSAG (Dec 2022) of the qualifications under ITU-T A.4, A.5 and A.6. |
| 6.3 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: Working document to discuss a possible way forward for Recs ITU-T A.4 and A.6 | ([TD275](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0275/en)R1) | This TD is a working document to support the discussion on contribution C29.  *For* ***discussion*** *in the ad hoc group:* *Thu 1 June, 13:30-14:15* |

C29 was introduced by Interdigital, Canada.

TD275R1 is an attempt from the Rapporteur to facilitate discussion on this issue. It is proposed to consider this document during an ad hoc group.

* **RG-WM agreed to organize an ad hoc group on ITU-T A.4, A.5 and A.6 on Thursday 1 June at 13:30-14:15.**

**7 Rec. ITU-T A.7 "Focus groups: Establishment and working procedures"**

The following documents were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 7.1 | China Telecommunications Corp., Ministry of Industry and Information Technology (MIIT) (China): Proposal for the revised text of Rec. ITU-T A.7 | ([C035](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-C-0035)) | RG-WM has held two interim meetings to discuss the revision of Rec. ITU-T A.7. A couple of urgent tasks were also identified. Recognizing that some key issues remain unresolved, this contribution provides **proposals** for the revision of Rec. ITU‑T A.7. |
| 7.2 | Egypt, Saudi Arabia, United Arab Emirates: Compilation to support the discussion on Recommendation ITU-T A.7 | ([C037](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T22-TSAG-C-0037)) | This contribution **aims to** maintain the flexibility nature of the Focus Groups, as some comments during e-meetings of revising Recommendation ITU-T A.7 might cause limitations on existing working procedures of Focus Groups. |
| 7.3 | Editor, Rec. ITU-T A.7: Compilation to support the discussion on Recommendation ITU-T A.7 | ([TD217R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0217)) | This document is a consolidated revised text that compiles all WTSA-20 proposals to modify Rec. ITU-T A.7 and contribution [DOC1 (230214)](https://extranet.itu.int/meetings/ITU-T/T22-TSAGRGM/RGWM-230214/DOCs/T22-TSAGRGM-RGWM-230214-DOC-0001.docx) from the UK. It has been reviewed until (new) clause 8.1 at the 14 Feb and 18 Apr 2023 interim meetings of RG‑WM.  *For* ***discussion*** *at the editing session (concentrating on listed open issues): Thu 1 June, 17:45-19:30.* |

C35 was briefly introduced by China Telecom.

C37 was introduced presented by Saudi Arabia which mentioned that the provisions provided are important to be included in TD217R1.

TD217R1 is an attempt from the Rapporteur to facilitate discussion on A.7-rev. It is proposed to consider this document as baseline for discussion during an editing session. The editing session will discuss the open issues that are listed on page 2 of TD217R1, which includes a compilation of all proposals received at this meeting as well as the results of the previous interim RG-WM meetings.

* **RG-WM agreed to organize an editing session on ITU-T A.7-rev on Thursday 1 June at 17:45-19:30.**

**8 Rec. ITU-T A.8 "Alternative approval process for new and revised ITU-T Recommendations"**

The following documents were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 8.1 | UK: Proposed amendment to Rec. ITU-T A.8 | ([C046](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-C-0046/en)) | This contribution **proposes** an amendment to Rec. ITU-T A.8 in order to ensure that all steps in the process are clearly documented.  *Note: The proposal has been included in* [*TD208R1*](http://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0208/en)*.* |
| 8.2 | Rapporteur, RG-WM: Working document to discuss possible changes to Rec. ITU-T A.8 | ([TD208R1](http://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0208/en)) | This TD is a working document to support the discussion about Rec. ITU-T A.8 based on the feedback from SG15 and TSB. It reflects the discussion at the 28 Feb 2023 interim meeting of RG-WM.  *For* ***discussion*** *at the editing session: Wed 31 May, 13:30-14:15.* |

The Rapporteur mentioned that C046 proposes to modify Figure 1 in Rec. ITU-T A.8 to reflect a current provision in this Recommendation. The Rapporteur had TSB involved to redraft the figure which has been included in the TD208R1.

TD208R1 is an attempt from the Rapporteur to facilitate discussion on A.8-rev. It is proposed to consider this document as baseline for discussion during an editing session. The editing session will discuss the open issues that are listed in TD208R1, which includes a compilation of all proposals received at this meeting as well as the results of the previous interim RG-WM meetings.

* **RG-WM agreed to organize an editing session on ITU-T A.8-rev on Wednesday 31 May at 13:30-14:15.**

**9 Review of suggested ad hoc groups, editing sessions and interim meetings**

The following suggested ad hoc groups and editing sessions were considered:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 9.1 | Suggested ad hoc groups and editing sessions | ([TD170R7](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0170)) | * Wed 31 May, 13:30-14:15: editing session for Rec. ITU-T A.8 ([TD208R1](http://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0208/en)) * Wed 31 May, 17:45-19:30: editing session on Rec. ITU-T A.1 ([TD255R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0255/en)) * Thu 1 June, 08:30-09:15: ad hoc group on the Author's guide for drafting ITU-T Recommendations ([TD245R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0245)) * Thu 1 June, 13:30-14:15: ad hoc group on a proposed way forward for Recs ITU-T A.4, A.5 and A.6 ([TD275](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0275/en)) * Thu 1 June, 17:45-19:30: editing session on Rec. ITU-T A.7 ([TD217R1](https://www.itu.int/md/T22-TSAG-230530-TD-GEN-0217)) |

The above ad hoc groups and editing sessions were agreed as proposed.

The meeting was adjourned at 17h30.

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_