|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| ITU Logo | INTERNATIONAL TELECOMMUNICATION UNION**TELECOMMUNICATIONSTANDARDIZATION SECTOR**STUDY PERIOD 2017-2020 | TSAG-TD1253 |
| **TSAG** |
| **Original: English** |
| **Question(s):** | N/A | E-Meeting, 10-17 January 2022 |
| **TD** |
| **Source:** | Chairman AHG-GME |
| **Title:** | Updated summary of issues for governance of virtual and hybrid meetings (RGM online, 13 December 2021) – Draft C, clean version |
| **Purpose:** | Admin |
| **Contact:** | Phil RushtonAHG-GME ChairmanUK | E-mail: philrushton@rcc-uk.uk |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Keywords:** | governance; management; e-meetings; |
| **Abstract:** | This document contains a further revised version ("Draft C") of the list of issues for governance of virtual and hybrid meetings identified in DOC4 at this AHG that has re-ordered the issues thematically, to input as a TD for the TSAG meeting in January 2022. This document is made available for review and as the basis for contributions to TSAG by the TSAG participants. Further contributions are invited based on this (clean) version of the Draft C list. |

The output of the initial discussion on the set of issues in DOC1-R1 (RGM online, 13 December 2021) were recorded in DOC4. That discussion utilised a number of categories.so as to consider the relevance and potential use of the issues identified. These categories appear in Column 3, and the issues have been re-ordered according to their initial assessment of the issues against the choices. The categories mean the following:

* Options: principle issues that apply in general
* Prior, Start, During, Post: issues that apply prior, at the start, during, or after the meeting, respectively

This TD should be the basis for further discussion and for contributions to further progress the work.

NOTE – A revision-marked version of this document is available as in the [IFA](https://www.itu.int/ifa/t/2017/tsag/exchange/AHG-GME/) for the AHG-GME RGM, see [AHG-GME-DOC5](https://www.itu.int/ifa/t/2017/tsag/exchange/AHG-GME/TSAG%20AHG-GME-DOC5.docx) (2021-12).

List of issues for governance of virtual and hybrid meetings (Draft C)

| Issue | Original Source | Categories | Note |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Definition of types of meeting: virtual, hybrid, physical, mixed, … | AHG-GME DOC2 (2021-12) | Options | See docs from TSB |
| We also propose to consider he hybrid system in Study Group meetings | TSAG-C201 | Options |  |
| The General Rules of conferences, assemblies and meetings of the Union [PP GR] apply to meetings with remote participation, in particular clauses 20.2 (Order of debates), 20.8 (Limitation of speeches) and 20.9 (Closing the list of speeches). | ITU-T A.Sup4 – §7.5 | Options | The GR are applicable to all meetings. |
| the necessary measures regarding electronic working methods should be adopted to ensure that virtual/remote access for ITU-T members to all work activities is provided on an equal footing in regard to in-person participation, including (upon request and where possible) interpretation into the six official languages of ITU; | WTSA20-C39-A32 | Options |  |
| that work activities conducted via electronic methods should be considered equal to, simultaneous to and fully integrated with in-person working methods used by ITU-T | WTSA20-C39-A32 | Options | Allowances must be made to intrinsic difficulties related to remote meetings (e.g. audio quality)?Should captioning be made part of record of the meeting? (or: be made available to support following the debates?) |
| scheduling of the meeting (as a whole) times occurrence of the slots within the meetings | TSAG-C192 | Prior; Start; During |  |
| Remote participants are encouraged to use the remote facility through a landline (when available), or to use a headset (and not the microphone and speaker of their machine). Remote participants should make sure that the loudspeaker on their machine is muted when they call from a landline. | ITU-T A.Sup4 – §8.1 | prior; start; during | Will need to be reviewed in view of the evolution of network and equipment.Should a minimum set of communication quality requirements be defined? |
| Such core hours need to recognise the impact upon remote participants, both those participants who are behind Geneva time for the start of a virtual meeting, and those who are ahead of Geneva time for the finish of a virtual meeting. | TSAG-C192 | Options | Define alternative standard meeting zone times? |
| Within the core office hours of Geneva, and meeting schedule should, in line with the approach of Council and of TSAG, reduce the number of hours for a virtual meeting each day, but increase the days of the meeting [if required] instead | TSAG-C192 | Options | Reduce hours vs increase number of days? What kinds of meeting are included for the hours rule? |
| There should be avoidance of overlaps between sessions;  | TSAG-C192 | Options | TSAG and (larger) SGs as well as AHGs and RGMs may have different requirements |
| At least one of the group leaders (chair, convenor or secretary) is able to participate at the physical location of the HYM | TSAG-TD1128 - §4.5 | Option |  |
| When scheduling the time for meetings with remote participation or for e-meetings, consideration should be given to the different time zones of the expected remote participants. Consideration should also be given to, when practical, scheduling relevant agenda items identified by a remote participant to better accommodate the remote participant's time zone. | ITU-T A.Sup4 – §6.1 | Options | Timings |
| Consideration that the meeting can be scheduled to accommodate, as much as possible, time zone differences for those physically present and those participating virtually | TSAG-TD1128 - §4.5 | Option | Related to timings |
| Every effort should be made to avoid requiring participants to work in the middle of the night in their time zone (approximately 00:00 to 05:00). | TSAG-TD1128 - §4.4 | Options;  | Related to the timing of meetings (working hours) |
| inconsistent approach to submission deadlines | TSAG-C192 | Options; Prior |  |
| calling notices for meetings such as Rapporteur Group Meetings should, if approved by the parent body, give sufficient notice for participants and a deadline that allows sufficient time for review of contributions | TSAG-C192 | Options; Prior | Deadlines depend on the type of the meeting. Also related to the need for consistency with deadline for docs. |
| Persons with disabilities can mention their specific needs (for example, captioning) on the registration form. | ITU-T A.Sup4 – §10.3 | Prior | Ties in with the ITU accessibility policy. |
| The calling notice shall include a request for notification of any specific accessibility needs | TSAG-TD1057 – §4 | Option; Prior | 1) "Request for notification" is a specific ISO process. Still relevant for ITU?2) Sign language? Policy for systematic captioning? See [ITU accessibility-policy](https://www.itu.int/md/S21-CL-C-0072/en). |
| The calling notice meeting agenda indicates the format in which the meeting will be conducted:physical meetings (face-to-face);physical meetings with remote observation (i.e., webcast);physical meetings with (active) remote participation (see also clause 7.1);e-meetings, also called virtual meetings (see also clause 7.1).NOTE – The first two formats are not covered by this Supplement. The meeting format could be based on a variety of criteria, including, but not limited to, the nature of the meeting, whether the meeting is held inside or outside Geneva and technical capabilities available for the meeting. | ITU-T A.Sup4 – §6.4 | Prior | Make sure provisions in A.1/ Res.1 are met. |
| If remote participation is to be arranged for participation in a group meeting, TSB should be informed at least twelve calendar days before the group meeting, to allow for enough time for logistics arrangements. | ITU-T A.Sup4 – §6.2 | Options; Prior | Different types of meeting needs to be taken into account. Still relevant? TSB 🡪 members? Meeting notifications should be covered elsewhere, this item becomes N/A. |
| If the group chairman is expected to participate remotely, the group should identify an acting chairman in case the chairman is unable to connect | ITU-T A.Sup4 – §6.3 | Options; Prior; start |  |
| [For meetings with remote participation]All remote participants are muted by default and will be unmuted by the remote participation moderator on a case-by-case basis, if they so request through the remote participation tool.NOTE – The remote participation moderator would then inform the meeting that a remote participant can intervene and the chairman would include the remote participant in the queue of meeting participants who want to intervene. | ITU-T A.Sup4 – §7.1.2 | Prior | To be reviewed when meeting types are defined. |
| In the case of physical meetings with remote participation, the group chairman and the remote participation moderator are encouraged to meet in the room ten minutes before the scheduled start of the meeting to check that the system is working and that the group chairman can display and share documents. | ITU-T A.Sup4 – §7.2 | Prior | May be applicable to virtual meetings as well. |
| It is recommended that remote participants connect at least five minutes before the start of a meeting to avoid disturbance. This will also allow for the group chairman and/or the remote participation moderator to check sound levels | ITU-T A.Sup4 – §8.2 | Prior | It may depend of the type of meeting. |
| Group leaders must assess their members by their locations and propose appropriate starting times for [Virtual meetings] VRM or [hybrid meetings] HYM that will accommodate all participants to the degree possible | TSAG-TD1128 - §4.4 | Prior | Link to timing of sessions. What about AHG meetings outside SG/TSAG regular meeting times. |
| Groups should decide on the duration and starting times of HYM and the timing of breaks, taking into consideration the needs of both the physical and virtual participants and the time zone of the location designated by the host. | TSAG-TD1128 - §4.5 | Prior; During (or start?) | Related to the timing of meetings (working hours). Physical meetings don't have these limits. Specific rights for each type of meeting depend on definition and may need to amend GR. An analysis on the taxonomy of types is welcome. |
| changes to the schedule should be notified in a manner that is both timely, transparent and consistent;  | TSAG-C192 | Prior; During |  |
| All remote participants are unmuted by default and can intervene at any time. To prevent interference of background noise, the chair reminds remote participants to mute their microphones until when they wish to contribute | ITU-T A.Sup4 – §7.1.1 | Start | Review as per current practice in view of existing tools. |
| At the beginning of each meeting with remote participation, the group chairman announces that there is a remote facility and requests that all remote participants introduce themselves by mentioning their name and affiliation.NOTE – Remote participants who join a meeting after the initial introduction of participants are expected to announce their arrival by mentioning their name and affiliation. If the remote participation tool announces participants' arrival with a specific sound, the group chairman asks new participants to introduce themselves. | ITU-T A.Sup4 – §7.3 | Start | Could be simplified if not removed. A consistent approach to presenting participant's affiliation would be beneficial. |
| The group chairman encourages all participants to announce their name and affiliation clearly before speaking | ITU-T A.Sup4 – §7.4 | Start | Participants to state in which capacity they speak. |
| Remote participants are encouraged to announce their name and affiliation clearly before making any intervention | ITU-T A.Sup4 – §8.3 |  | Repeated; consolidate |
| the occurrence of the slots within the meetings | TSAG-C192 | Start; During |  |
| Where supported by the remote participation tool, the chairman or the remote participation moderator is permitted to mute remote participants with bad connections or whose connections introduce too much noise, or may ask them to leave the meeting if the situation cannot be remedied. | ITU-T A.Sup4 – §7.6 | Start, during | Clarity needed on how to handle difficulty in communications during a decision making part of the meeting. |
| Remote participants should speak from a quiet place without background noise. They should speak slowly and clearly to allow the other participants to compensate for any audio problem. They are encouraged to end their remarks with the phrase "This concludes my intervention." | ITU-T A.Sup4 – §8.4 | During |  |
| If the connection is poor, and if requested by the chairman, remote participants should be prepared to type their question or comment in the chat window of the remote participation tool. | ITU-T A.Sup4 – §8.5 | During | Should proposal or decision typed in the chat be included as a valid intervention? |
| During a physical meeting with remote participation, remote participants accept that, in case of technical problems (e.g., lost connection), their participation may be interrupted (see also clause 8.8) while the physical meeting will continue, whereas in case of onsite technical issues (e.g., headphone failure), the chairman may decide to suspend the meeting until the problem is solved. | ITU-T A.Sup4 – §8.6 | During | Consequences / implications will depend on the type of meeting. |
| Remote participants accept that in case of technical problems (e.g., lost connection) during an e-meeting, the chairman will assess whether enough participants are still connected and will decide whether to continue the meeting (see also clause 8.8) or to suspend the meeting until the problem is solved. | ITU-T A.Sup4 – §8.7 | During | Consequences / implications will depend on the type of meeting. The GR define the conditions for quorum when decision-making is considered. Guidance needed for non-decision making parts of a meeting? |
| Remote participants may report problems to the remote participation moderator (when available) who should determine where the cause lies and should either take direct remedial action or offer advice as appropriate. | ITU-T A.Sup4 – §8.8 | During | Adequate support needs to be in place. |
| For the different meeting modes and types, the due dates for:Calling Notice/logistics/preliminary agenda;Draft agenda;Proposals for new agenda items / proposals for the addition of new work items;Contributions on existing agenda items and submitted documents;Meeting report | TSAG-TD1057 – §5.5 |  | Review postponed to a subsequent meeting. |
| The chair or convenor shall ensure that the identity of all remote participants is known and shall ensure that all participants are noted on an attendance list that is electronically distributed at the end of the meeting. | TSAG-TD1057 – §5.7 |  | Review postponed to a subsequent meeting. |
| All remote participants shall identify themselves according to the group’s guidelines for authentication when available | TSAG-TD1057 – §5.7 |  | Review postponed to a subsequent meeting. |
| The chair or convenor shall establish proper etiquette for the calls, including establishing a way for remote participants to ask for the floor, for example by asking participants to:announce their name each time they speak;be brief and clear;speak slowly so that those for whom English is not their native language can understand; andmute their microphone when they are not speaking. | TSAG-TD1057 – §5.7 |  | Review postponed to a subsequent meeting. |
| The chair, convenor and secretariat shall take into consideration the time zones of all members of the group. When the group members are distributed world-wide, 0500 UTC, 1300 UTC or 2100 UTC are acceptable virtual meeting times to share the inconvenience | TSAG-TD1057 – §7.1 |  | Review postponed to a subsequent meeting. |
| When scheduling a virtual meeting, care shall be taken that the meeting does not unduly encroach on the public holidays and weekends of the participants (noting that the definition of weekend varies culturally, and that avoiding weekends in all time zones and at the beginning and end of the week might be difficult | TSAG-TD1057 – §7.1 |  | Review postponed to a subsequent meeting. |
| Chairs and convenors should take into consideration, when brought to their attention:• laws and regulations that apply (e.g., in some jurisdictions, a rest period is mandated by law);• the national holidays and cultural practices of the countries of all the group members. | TSAG-TD1057 – §7.1 |  | Review postponed to a subsequent meeting. |
| For a JTC 1 or SC plenary, the following deadlines shall apply:• at least eight weeks in advance for calling notices and draft agendas;• at least six weeks in advance for proposals for new agenda items and for proposals for the addition of new work item proposals;• at least three weeks in advance for contributions on existing agenda items and submitted documents.For a WG meeting, the following deadlines should apply:• At least four weeks for calling notice and preliminary agenda;• At least two weeks for draft agenda;• At the discretion of the group for other documents.For advisory and ad hoc groups deadlines for calling notices, agenda and documents are at the discretion of the group. | TSAG-TD1057 – §7.2 |  | Review postponed to a subsequent meeting. |
| All participants who wish to take part in a discussion, or be party to a decision, shall be able to do so; the chairs shall describe, in the calling notice or agenda, what procedure(s) they will follow when participants lose connectivity (i.e. the ability to participate) for reasons not under their control. | TSAG-TD1057 – §7.2 |  | Review postponed to a subsequent meeting. |
| During virtual meetings with a national delegation structure, the head of each delegation (and an alternate, in case the Head of Delegation experiences a network failure during the course of the meeting) shall be identified. | TSAG-TD1057 – §7.3 |  | Review postponed to a subsequent meeting. |
| Participants should make every effort to establish reliable connectivity; the selection of the conference bridge is the responsibility of the chair, convenor or secretariat. | TSAG-TD1057 – §7.3 |  | Review postponed to a subsequent meeting. |
| All participants should follow best practices to ensure information security, cybersecurity and privacy protection. | TSAG-TD1057 – §7.4 |  | Review postponed to a subsequent meeting. |
| All meeting times shall be given in Coordinated Universal Time (UTC). | TSAG-TD1057 – §7.5.1 |  | Review postponed to a subsequent meeting. |
| Virtual meetings should:• have a three-hour limit per session with at least a 5 minute break half-way;• consist of no more than six hours of sessions in each 24 hour period. The chair, convenor or secretariat should:• take into account related meetings happening concurrently during the same time frame (e.g. WG meetings held between SC opening plenary and closing plenary meetings);• consider a minimum break of 30 minutes between sessions to ensure adequate breaks. | TSAG-TD1057 – §7.5.1 |  | Review postponed to a subsequent meeting. |
| A preliminary agenda of a virtual meeting shall be circulated with the calling notice. For JTC 1 and SC plenary meetings, this is also the draft agenda | TSAG-TD1057 – §7.5.2 |  | Review postponed to a subsequent meeting. |
| [For hybrid meetings]The chair and committee manager should be physically present at the meeting | TSAG-TD1057 – §8 |  | Review postponed to a subsequent meeting. |
| *It is recommended that the technologies used for remote participation are those available from the ITU, even for meetings held outside Geneva* | *ITU-T A.Sup4 – §6.5* | *Potentially remove* | *MyMeetings is presumed as available.* |
| *For meetings held outside Geneva with (active) remote participation, it is recommended that hosts be supplied with guidelines in order to minimize possible technical issues related to remote participation. These guidelines (e.g., in the form of a checklist) should be accessible for the host well in advance before the event, and should include all the technical and logistics requirements for providing the remote participation facility.* | *ITU-T A.Sup4 – §6.6* | *Potentially remove* | *Guidelines should be developed and made available for the remote participation tools and means of access supported by ITU.*  |
| Ensure that information and registration processes are accessible to allAll web-based content and functionality such as announcement e-mails, online registration forms, online agendas, discussion documents in Portable Document Format (PDF) [ISO 32000-1:2008] (accessible PDF only) or other formats should adhere to the W3C Web Content Accessibility Guidelines [W3C WCAG 2.0]. | FSTP-2015-ACC – §5.1.1 |  | Skipped at the RGM |
| Provide real time captioning | FSTP-2015-ACC – §5.1.2 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Provide Audio streaming from the meeting room | FSTP-2015-ACC – §5.1.3 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Provide sign language interpretation when needed | FSTP-2015-ACC – §5.1.4 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Provide a way for the remote participant to ask to make a comment or ask a question | FSTP-2015-ACC – §5.1.5 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Allow interventions by text | FSTP-2015-ACC – §5.1.7 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Enable communication directly with the remote participation moderator and/or technical support | FSTP-2015-ACC – §5.1.8 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Provide information in advance on how to participate remotely | FSTP-2015-ACC – §5.1.9 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Ensure that the remote participation tools are accessible and available to as many persons with specific needs as possible including persons with disabilities. | FSTP-2015-ACC – §5.1.10 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Ensure access to contents of presentations for participants with vision impairments | FSTP-2015-ACC – §5.1.11 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Ensure that meeting documents are accessible and available to as many persons with specific needs as possible including persons with disabilities | FSTP-2015-ACC – §5.1.12 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Ensure that speakers can be clearly understood | FSTP-2015-ACC – §5.2.1 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Ensure that presenters are aware of the needs of all the audience | FSTP-2015-ACC – §5.2.2 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Allow remote participants to control layout and the presentation of their screens | FSTP-2015-ACC – §5.2.4 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Additional information to help with access to contents of presentations for persons with disabilitiesAll videos should be captioned for participants who are deaf.Audiovisual presentations should be available in formats that are accessible to participants with visual impairments using assistive technologies.If the content of the presentation is essential and is not described by the presenter, both points above become Priority 1 (essential). | FSTP-2015-ACC – §5.3.1 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Avoid timing discrepancies | FSTP-2015-ACC – §5.3.2 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Ensure that remote participants feel that they are part of the meeting | FSTP-2015-ACC – §5.3.3 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Find out about remote participants’ needs | FSTP-2015-ACC – §5.3.4 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Budget for accessible remote participation | FSTP-2015-ACC – §6.1 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Find out about remote participants’ needs | FSTP-2015-ACC – §6.2 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Publish information for participants in advance | FSTP-2015-ACC – §6.3 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Provide training to meeting chairman | FSTP-2015-ACC – §6.4 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Provide instructions to presenters | FSTP-2015-ACC – §6.5 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Run test sessions before the meeting | FSTP-2015-ACC – §6.6 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Start the meeting with clear rules | FSTP-2015-ACC – §6.7 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Active encouragement to participate | FSTP-2015-ACC – §6.8 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Post the transcript of the real time captioning | FSTP-2015-ACC – §6.9 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| [for hybrid meetings?]Remote participation is possible but limited: not for decision-making | TSAG-TD1125 – slide 4 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| [for hybrid meetings?]Only those physically present in the meeting room can participate in decision-makingSupport from local mission staff to complement capital’s participation | TSAG-TD1125 – slide 4 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| Proxy rights for voting (exclusively) can be given to another administration (see CV 335) | TSAG-TD1125 – slide 4 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |
| A Member State cannot speak on behalf of another Member State (see CV 335-338) | TSAG-TD1125 – slide 4 |  | Skipped at the RGM. |

References:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| [AHG-GME DOC2](https://www.itu.int/ifa/t/2017/tsag/exchange/AHG-GME/TSAG%20AHG-GME-DOC2.docx)  | [UK, Japan] Review of Draft A of the “Summary of issues for governance of Virtual and Hybrid meetings” document (2021-12) |
| [TSAG-C201](https://www.itu.int/ifa/t/2017/tsag/exchange/AHG-GME/TSAG-C201-Consid_fut_emtgs-EG.docx)  | [Egypt] Contribution on the use of electronic working methods in future meetings (2021-10) |
| [WTSA20-C39-A32](https://www.itu.int/ifa/t/2017/tsag/exchange/AHG-GME/WTSA20-C039-A32-Res_IAP3-EqFooting_Phy_Virt-CITEL.docx) | [CITEL] Draft New Resolution [IAP-3]: Use of in-person and virtual options on an equal footing in the activities of the ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector (2021) |
| [TSAG-TD1128](https://www.itu.int/ifa/t/2017/tsag/exchange/AHG-GME/TSAG-TD1128-ISO_IEC_Guide_emeetings-Att1-ISO-TMB_N1079V1.pdf) | [ISO/IEC] Meetings Guidance 1.0 - TMB/SMB Guidance on effective virtual and hybrid meetings (2021-10) |
| [TSAG-TD1057](https://www.itu.int/ifa/t/2017/tsag/exchange/AHG-GME/TSAG-TD1057-ISO-IEC_Draft_Rev_SD19_Meetings.pdf) | [ISO/IEC] Draft Revised Standing Document 19 (SD19), Meetings (2021-10) |
| [ITU-T A.Sup4](https://www.itu.int/ifa/t/2017/tsag/exchange/AHG-GME/A.Sup4-201506-Guidelines_remote_participation.pdf) | Supplement on guidelines for remote participation (2015) |
| [FSTP.ACC-RemPart](https://www.itu.int/ifa/t/2017/tsag/exchange/AHG-GME/FSTP-ACC-RemPart-2015-Accessible_emeetings.pdf) | Guidelines for supporting remote participation in meetings for all (2015) |
| [TSAG-TD1125](https://www.itu.int/ifa/t/2017/tsag/exchange/AHG-GME/TSAG-TD1125-IRM-WTSA_pres_update.zip) | TSB updates on WTSA-20 preparations for the Inter-Regional Meeting (IRM), 21 October 2021; Attachment 1 (2021-10) |

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_