|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| ITU logo | INTERNATIONAL TELECOMMUNICATION UNION  **TELECOMMUNICATION STANDARDIZATION SECTOR**  STUDY PERIOD 2017-2020 | | | TSAG-TD459R1 | |
| **TSAG** | |
| **Original: English** | |
| **Question(s):** | | | RG-SC | Geneva, 23-27 September 2019 | |
| **TD** | | | | | |
| **Source:** | | | Rec. ITU-T A.5 editor | | |
| **Title:** | | | Resolution of comments for the TAP consultation on revised Rec. ITU-T A.5 | | |
| **Purpose:** | | | Discussion | | |
| **Contact:** | | Olivier Dubuisson Orange France | | | Tel: +33 2 96 07 38 50 E-mail: [olivier.dubuisson@orange.com](mailto:olivier.dubuisson@orange.com) |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Keywords:** | ITU-T A. 5; normative references |
| **Abstract:** | This document gathers all comments received as a result of the TAP consultation on revised Rec. ITU-T A.5 with a proposed resolution of each of them by the editor, for discussion in RG-SC. |

The following documents have been consolidated in a new copy of [report R5](https://www.itu.int/dms_pub/itu-t/md/17/tsag/r/T17-TSAG-R-0005!R1!MSW-E.docx) Rev.1:

* Saudi Arabia's comments to the TAP Consultation (in reply to TSB Circular 138) ([TD 567](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T17-TSAG-190923-TD-GEN-0567));
* United Arab Emirates' comments to the TAP Consultation (in reply to TSB Circular 138) ([TD 575](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T17-TSAG-190923-TD-GEN-0575));
* Russian Federation's comments to the TAP Consultation (in reply to TSB Circular 138) ([TD 580](https://www.itu.int/md/meetingdoc.asp?lang=en&parent=T17-TSAG-190923-TD-GEN-0580));
* Canada: A-Series TAP comment reactions ([C 91](https://www.itu.int/md/T17-TSAG-C-0091/en)).

This TD is an attempt from the editor to propose a resolution for each contributor's suggested change (with explanations given as Microsoft Word's comments) while ensuring consistency with other clauses of Rec. ITU-T A.5 and with other A-series Recommendations. This TD will be modified during the discussions in the Rapporteur group on strengthening cooperation.

Revision 1 of this TD takes account of the discussions at the joint meeting of RG-WM and RG-SC.

**Note: Contributors are encouraged to discuss the proposed resolution of comments with the Editor and/or the Rapporteur in advance of the RG-SC meeting sessions.**

|  |
| --- |
| Draft revised Recommendation ITU-T A.5  Generic procedures for including references to documents of other organizations in ITU‑T Recommendations |

|  |
| --- |
| Summary  Recommendation ITU-T A.5 provides generic procedures for normatively referencing documents of other organizations in ITU-T Recommendations. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| History   |  |  |  |  |  | | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | | Edition | Recommendation | Approval | Study Group | Unique ID[[1]](#footnote-1)\* | | 1.0 | ITU-T A.5 | 1998-01-14 | TSAG | [11.1002/1000/4193](http://handle.itu.int/11.1002/1000/4193) | | 1.1 | ITU-T A.5 Annex B | 1998-09-07 | TSAG | [11.1002/1000/4457](http://handle.itu.int/11.1002/1000/4457) | | 2.0 | ITU-T A.5 | 2000-06-14 | TSAG | [11.1002/1000/5091](http://handle.itu.int/11.1002/1000/5091) | | 3.0 | ITU-T A.5 | 2001-11-30 | TSAG | [11.1002/1000/5579](http://handle.itu.int/11.1002/1000/5579) | | 4.0 | ITU-T A.5 | 2012-11-30 | TSAG | [11.1002/1000/11954](http://handle.itu.int/11.1002/1000/11954) | | 5.0 | ITU-T A.5 | 2016-02-05 | TSAG | [11.1002/1000/12598](http://handle.itu.int/11.1002/1000/12598) | |

|  |
| --- |
| Keywords  Normative references, qualification, references. |

**Table of Contents**

Page

1 Scope 1

2 References 1

3 Definitions 1

3.1 Terms defined elsewhere 1

3.2 Terms defined in this Recommendation 1

4 Abbreviations and acronyms 2

5 Conventions 2

6 Generic procedures for including references to documents of other organizations in ITU‑T Recommendations 2

7 Qualification of referenced organizations 3

Annex A – Format for documenting a study group or working party decision 5

Annex B – Criteria for qualifying organizations 6

Draft revised Recommendation ITU‑T A.5

Generic procedures for including references to documents of  
other organizations in ITU‑T Recommendations

# 1 Scope

This Recommendation provides generic procedures for normatively referencing the documents of other organizations in ITU‑T Recommendations. Annex B provides the criteria to qualify a referenced organization. Clauses 6 and 7 describe the procedures in detail. Annex A provides the format for documenting a study group or working party decision with respect to making the reference. Specific information regarding qualified organizations can be found on the ITU‑T website.

NOTE – These generic procedures do not apply to references to standards produced by ISO and IEC. The long-standing ability to make such references continues unchanged.

The case of ITU-T accepting texts, in part or in whole, from another organization is addressed in [ITU-T A.25].

# 2 References

The following ITU-T Recommendations and other references contain provisions which, through reference in this text, constitute provisions of this Recommendation. At the time of publication, the editions indicated were valid. All Recommendations and other references are subject to revision; users of this Recommendation are therefore encouraged to investigate the possibility of applying the most recent edition of the Recommendations and other references listed below. A list of the currently valid ITU-T Recommendations is regularly published. The reference to a document within this Recommendation does not give it, as a stand-alone document, the status of a Recommendation.

[ITU-T A.1] Recommendation ITU-T A.1 (2012), *Working methods for study groups of the ITU Telecommunication Standardization Sector (ITU-T)*.

[ITU-T A.25] Recommendation ITU-T A.25 (2016), *Generic procedures for incorporating text between ITU-T and other organizations*.

# 3 Definitions

## 3.1 Terms defined elsewhere

This Recommendation uses the following terms defined elsewhere:

**3.1.1** **normative reference** [ITU-T A.1]: The whole or parts of another document that contains provisions which, through reference to it, constitute provisions to the referring document.

## 3.2 Terms defined in this Recommendation

This Recommendation defines the following terms:

**3.2.1** **approved document**: An official output (such as a standard, a specification, an implementation agreement, etc.) which has been formally approved by an organization.

**3.2.2 non-normative reference**: The whole or parts of a document where the referenced document has been used as supplementary information in the preparation of the Recommendation or to assist the understanding or use of the Recommendation, and to which conformance is not necessary.

**3.2.3 referenced organization**: An organization for which an ITU‑T study group identifies the need to make a specific reference (either normative or non-normative) to one of its document.

# 4 Abbreviations and acronyms

None.

# 5 Conventions

None.

# 6 Generic procedures for including references to documents of other organizations in ITU‑T Recommendations

**6.1** An ITU‑T study group or a member of a study group may identify the need to make a specific reference (either normative or non-normative) to a document from another organization within a specific draft Recommendation. It is preferred that, rather than making reference to an entire document from an outside organization, reference be made to only the specific section(s) concerned.

The requirements of clauses 6.2 and 6.3 do not apply for non-normative references, since such referenced documents are not considered to be an integral part of an ITU‑T Recommendation. They are documents that add to the reader's understanding but are not essential to the implementation of, or compliance with, the Recommendation.

**6.2** For normative references, a member submits a contribution, or the Rapporteur or Editor submits a TD (with the same deadline as for contributions), to the study group or working party providing information, as outlined in clauses 6.2.1 to 6.2.9.

The study group or working party evaluates this information and decides whether to make the reference. The format for documenting the study group or working party decision is given in Annex A.

Specific criteria for the qualification of the considered organization are provided in Annex B. The list of those qualified organizations is on the Databases page of the ITU‑T website[[2]](#footnote-2).

**6.2.1** A clear description of the document considered for reference (type of document, title, number, version, date, etc.).

**6.2.2** Status of approval. Referencing a document that has not yet been approved by the referenced organization can lead to confusion; thus, normative referencing is usually limited to approved documents. If absolutely necessary, such a reference can be made where cooperative work requiring cross-references is being approved by ITU‑T and another organization in approximately the same time-frame.

**6.2.3** Justification for the specific reference.

**6.2.4** Current information, if any, about intellectual property rights issues (patent policy and existing patents, copyrights for software and/or text, marks).

**6.2.5** Other information that might be useful in describing the "quality" of the document (e.g., whether products have been implemented using it, whether conformance requirements are clear, whether the specification is readily and widely available).

**6.2.6** The degree of stability or maturity of the document (e.g., length of time it has existed).

**6.2.7** Relationship with other existing or emerging documents in ITU-T or in other standards development organizations.

**6.2.8** When a document is to be referenced in an ITU‑T Recommendation, all explicit references within the referenced document should also be listed.

**6.2.9** Qualification of referenced organization (per clause 7). This need only be done the first time a document from the referenced organization is being considered for referencing and only if such qualification information has not been documented already.

**6.2.10** A full copy of the existing document. No reformatting is necessary. The objective is to have referenced documents available via the web at no cost, so that the study group or working party may proceed with its evaluation. Accordingly, if a document to be referenced is available in this manner, it is sufficient for the contributing member to provide its exact location on the web. On the other hand, if the document is not available in this manner, a full copy must be provided (in electronic format if permissible by the referenced organization, otherwise in paper format).

**6.3** For normative references only, the study group or working party evaluates the above information and comes to its conclusions based on the usual consensus process. The decision of the study group or working party shall be documented using the format in Annex A. This requirement must be completed, at the latest, [normally] two days before the time the Recommendation is proposed for determination under the traditional approval process (TAP) or consent under the alternative approval process (AAP).

If there is consensus, the study group or working party report may simply note that the procedures of Recommendation ITU‑T A.5 have been satisfied and provide a pointer to the document where the full details reside.

**6.4** If the study group or working party decides to make the normative reference, it should be introduced with the standard text provided in clause 2 of the "Author's guide for drafting ITU‑T Recommendations".

NOTE – In the case of texts produced jointly by ITU‑T and ISO/IEC JTC 1, it is recognized that clause 6.6 of the [Rules for presentation of ITU-T | ISO/IEC common texts](http://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/about/groups/Documents/Rules-for-presentation-ITU-T-ISO-IEC.pdf)[[3]](#footnote-3) apply.

# 7 Qualification of referenced organizations

**7.1** To ensure the continued quality of the ITU‑T Recommendations, it is necessary to evaluate the document being proposed for normative reference, but it is also necessary for the study group or working party to consider the referenced organization according to the criteria set out in clauses 7.1.1, 7.1.2 and 7.1.3.

**7.1.1** Qualification of the referenced organization according to Annex B should be conducted before considering a normative reference from that organization. If the referenced organization has already been qualified according to the criteria in Annex B (or previously to Recommendation ITU‑T A.4 or Recommendation ITU-T A.6), the evaluation may not need to be repeated, and only a note of the result is required.

**7.1.2** In addition, the referenced organization should have a process by which its output documents are published and regularly maintained (i.e. reaffirmed, revised, withdrawn, etc.).

**7.1.3** The referenced organization should also have a document change control process, including a clear, unambiguous document numbering scheme. In particular, a feature to look for is that updated versions of a given document be distinguishable from the earlier versions.

**7.2** Qualification of an organization according to the criteria in Annex B is reviewed on a regular basis by study groups that need to make normative references to documents of that organization. In particular, if the patent policy of that organization has changed, it is important to check that the new patent policy is consistent with the Common Patent Policy for ITU‑T/ITU‑R/ISO/IEC and the Guidelines for the Implementation of the Common Patent Policy for ITU‑T/ITU-R/ISO/IEC[[4]](#footnote-4).

**7.3** For the case of a [referenced] document [considered for reference is] jointly owned by multiple organizations in a joint collaboration arrangement that is not a legal entity (e.g., a partnership project without legal entity registration/status), the joint collaboration arrangement is considered to be qualified if each organization is itself qualified according to the criteria in Annex B. Annex B shall be mentioned in any Circular announcing a TAP consultation or any announcement for an AAP Last Call.

Annex A  
  
Format for documenting a study group or working party decision

(This annex forms an integral part of this Recommendation.)

The decision of the study group or working party with respect to making the normative reference must be documented in the meeting record using the following format:

**1** Clear description of the document.

(type of document, title, number, version, date, etc.).

**2** Status of approval:

(only approved documents should be considered)

**3** Justification for the specific reference.

**4** Current information, if any, about intellectual property rights issues:

(including patent policy and existing patents, copyrights for software and/or text, marks).

**5** Other useful information describing the "quality" of the document:

(e.g. length of time it has existed, whether products have been implemented using it, whether conformance requirements are clear, whether the specification is readily and widely available).

**6** The degree of stability or maturity of the document.

**7** Relationship with other existing or emerging documents in ITU-T or in other standards development organizations.**8** When a document is referenced in an ITU‑T Recommendation, all normative references within that referenced document should also be listed.

NOTE – A separate review is not required for all of these normative references. However, the referenced organization, if different from ISO or IEC, needs to be qualified under Annex B (and previously under Recommendation ITU-T A.4 or Recommendation ITU-T A.6). If the referenced organization for a normative reference is not qualified, a qualification under Annex B should be performed first. In addition, if the ITU-T Recommendation is planned for approval under the traditional approval process (TAP) found in Resolution 1 of the World Telecommunication Standardization Assembly (WTSA), all normative references in the referenced document should be reviewed.

**9** Qualification of referenced organization:

(This needs to be done only the first time that a document from the referenced organization is being considered for referencing, and only if such qualification information has not already been documented or if it has changed).

**9.1** Qualification under Annex B.

**9.2** Document publication and maintenance process.

**9.3** Document change control process.

**10** Location of a full copy of the document.

**11** Other (for any supplementary information).

Annex B  
  
Criteria for qualifying organizations

(This annex forms an integral part of this Recommendation.)

| Organization attributes | Desired characteristics |
| --- | --- |
| 1) Objectives/relationship of work to ITU‑T work | Should refer to development, adoption, implementation and use of national, regional or international standards, or to the provision of input into international standards organizations, especially ITU‑T. |
| 2) Organization:  – legal status;  – geographic scope;  – accreditation;  – secretariat;  – nominated representative. | – should indicate in which country/countries it has legal status;  – should indicate the scope of the standards of the organization;  – should indicate the accrediting entity;  – should identify the permanent secretariat;  – should nominate a representative. |
| 3) Membership/participation (openness) | – should describe the membership/participation model;  – membership/participation criteria should not preclude any party with material interest, especially ITU Member States and Sector Members; the criteria should not preclude or restrict any existing type of ITU membership to be a member of/participate in the other organization;  – membership/participation should comprise a significant representation of telecommunication interests; otherwise, an explanation should be provided. |
| 4) Technical subject areas | Should be relevant to a particular study group(s) or ITU‑T as a whole. |
| 5) Intellectual Property Rights Policy and Guidelines on:  a) patents;  b) software copyright (if applicable);  c) marks (if applicable); and  d) copyright | a) should be consistent with the "Common Patent Policy for  ITU‑T/ITU‑R/ISO/IEC" and the "Guidelines for Implementation of the Common Patent Policy for ITU‑T/ITU‑R/ISO/IEC"\*;  b) should be consistent with the "ITU‑T Software Copyright Guidelines"\*;  c) should be consistent with the "ITU‑T Guidelines related to the inclusion of Marks in ITU‑T Recommendations";  d) ITU and ITU Member States and Sector Members should have the right to copy for implementation- or standardization-related purposes (see also [ITU‑T A.1], clause 3.1.6, with regard to copying and distribution, or [ITU-T A.25], clause 6.2.1, with regard to incorporation, with or without modification). |
| 6) Working methods/processes | – should be documented;  – should be open, fair and transparent;  – should document anti-trust policy. |
| 7) Outputs | – should identify outputs available to ITU‑T;  – should identify the process for ITU‑T to obtain outputs. |
|  | \*) particularly, licences must be offered on a non-discriminatory basis and on reasonable terms and conditions (whether free of charge or with monetary compensation) to both members and non-members. |

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

1. \* To access the Recommendation, type the URL http://handle.itu.int/ in the address field of your web browser, followed by the Recommendation's unique ID. For example, [http://handle.itu.int/11.1002/1000/  
   11830-en](http://handle.itu.int/11.1002/1000/11830-en). [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. The current website is: <http://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/extcoop/Pages/sdo.aspx> [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. The current website is: <http://itu.int/en/ITU-T/about/groups/Documents/Rules-for-presentation-ITU-T-ISO-IEC.pdf> [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. See <http://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/ipr> [↑](#footnote-ref-4)