|  |
| --- |
|  |
|

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **PHYSICAL OPEN CONSULTATIONS OF THE COUNCIL WORKING GROUP ON INTERNATIONAL INTERNET-RELATED PUBLIC POLICY ISSUES** Geneva, 28 September 2015 |  |
| INTERNATIONAL TELECOMMUNICATION UNION |  |
|  |  |
|  | **Document OPCWGINT/2-E** |
| **11 September 2015** |
| **English only** |

|  |
| --- |
| COMPILATION OF RESPONSES TO THE online open consultation (june- aUGUST 2015)  The Plenipotentiary Conference 2014 instructed the ITU Council to revise its Resolution 1344 to direct the Council Working Group on international Internet-related public policy issues (CWG-Internet), limited to Member States, with open consultation to all stakeholders, and to conduct such open consultation according to specific guidelines. As a result the ITU Council in its 2015 session resolved that the CWG-Internet should hold both open online consultation and physical open consultation meetings, with remote participation, within a defined period prior to each CWG-Internet meeting.   ITU Council also resolved that all relevant inputs received in the open consultation will be available to the CWG-Internet and all other stakeholders on a dedicated publicly accessible webpage of the CWG-Internet website. Relevant inputs from the open online consultation on the topic(s) decided by the CWG-Internet will form the basis of discussion at the physical open consultation meetings and all relevant responses will be submitted to the CWG-Internet for consideration of the issues chosen for its next meeting. On 3 February 2015 the Council Working Group decided that Open Consultations would be convened on the following issue:  "With a view to discussing the establishment of Internet Exchange Points (IXPs) to advance connectivity, improve service quality and increase network stability and resilience, fostering competition and reducing interconnection costs, as proposed by Opinion 1 of WTPF-13 and consistent with PP-14 Resolutions 101 and 102, stakeholders are invited to elaborate and exemplify on the challenges faced and identify widely accepted best practices for the design, installation and operation of IXPs."  You can find below the compilation of the responses received: |

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Date | Submitter | Response |
| 1. | June 05, 2015 | [Association for Proper Internet Governance (Switzerland)](http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet/Pages/display-june2015.aspx?ListItemID=11) | Please find attached our contribution to this consultation.[View submitted document online](http://www.itu.int/en/Lists/consultation2015/Attachments/11/CWG%202015.pdf) |
| 2. | June 08, 2015 | [Regulator of the Republic of the Congo](http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet/Pages/display-june2015.aspx?ListItemID=15) | La politique des points d'échange Internet est une très bonne idée. Mais nous nous sommes rendu compte que seul le point d'échange ne suffit pas, il faudra associer à cette initiative les politiques de créations de contenus locaux, inciter les pays à la mise en place de e-admin à travers le e-gouv ainsi que le developpement des serveurs caches par exemple google cache, akamail, facebook... Les échangent de trafic IXP sont plus en plus important dans un environnement contenant les serveurs caches des grands fournisseurs de contenus. Ma suggestion est mettre en place un programme qui associ les IXP et les grands fournisseurs de contenus. c'est-à dire inclure l'acquisitions de serveurs caches dans la mise en place des IXP. |
| 3. | June 08, 2015 | [Angola ISP Association "AAPSI"](http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet/Pages/display-june2015.aspx?ListItemID=16) | Our Internet Association is owner of Angola-IXP. |
| 4. | July 24, 2015 | [Tanzania Communications Regulatory Authority (TCRA)](http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet/Pages/display-june2015.aspx?ListItemID=21) | Please find the attached document.  [View submitted document online](http://www.itu.int/en/Lists/consultation2015/Attachments/21/IXPS%20CHALLENGES.docx) |
| 5. | August 07, 2015 | [COTAS LTDA. (Bolivia)](http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet/Pages/display-june2015.aspx?ListItemID=22) | In Bolivia we have faced a very difficult environment in order to create our first IXP node. Since the actual government owns the biggest Telecom Operator (ENTEL S.A.) in the country and also controls the Regulator Entity, adding that there is no common sense in order to develop a neutral and open IXP, it is hard to have one of this working for the internet community as well. There are a lot of telecom cooperative companies and the evolution of Internet in the country is very low, mostly because the higher prices to get connected to the Internet Backbone considering we are a Mediterranean country (don't have access to the coast) and we have to pay also the transport service to bring the Internet from de coast to the boarder and then, from the boarder to the several states (about 1400 kms distance). What we have done so far is to be aware of the necessity of having an IXP, and have one point of contact between some ISP providers centralized in La Paz at the office of Entel company. This was done with the aim of LACNIC and ISOC. But, actually, the statements of its regulatory functions are abolished and the ISP's may have a new opportunity to rethink how it should work. There is a lot to talk about, but what I would like is to have like an official project for IXP's and its bases of operation and organization. |
| 6. | August 27, 2015 | [Communications Regulatory Authority “CRA” & Ministry of Information and Communications Technology “MICT” of the State of Qatar](http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet/Pages/display-june2015.aspx?ListItemID=23) | ​The attached submission is a joint position statement from the Communications Regulatory Authority “CRA” and the Ministry of Information and Communications Technology “MICT” of the State of Qatar to Submission to the ITU CWG-Internet for the open consultation: “Elaborate and exemplify on the challenges faced and identified widely accepted best practices for design, installation and operation of IXPs”  [View submitted document online](http://www.itu.int/en/Lists/consultation2015/Attachments/23/Submission%20to%20the%20ITU%20CWG-Internet%20-%20IXPs%20Consultation_AH.docx) |
| 7. | August 27, 2015 | [Communications Authority of Kenya (CA)](http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet/Pages/display-june2015.aspx?ListItemID=24) | Attached please find Kenya's response to the online open consultations of CWG-Internet.[View submitted document online](http://www.itu.int/en/Lists/consultation2015/Attachments/24/Kenyas%20Response%20to%20Online%20Open%20Consultations%20of%20CGW-Internet.pdf) |
| 8. | August 28, 2015 | [China Academy of Information and Communications Technology](http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet/Pages/display-june2015.aspx?ListItemID=25) | With the fast development of Internet in China, the demand of traffic exchange between small and midsized ISPs, ICPs, CDN enterprises and data centers has increased rapidly. To meet the needs of the market, new pattern IXPs need to be built to support traffic exchange.There are still several challenges to build IXPs in China. Firstly, to improve the efficiency of interconnection, a whole plan of building IXPs must be made.Secondly, a clear model of IXPs needs to be built. Finally, expertise of running an IXP is inadequate in China.  [View submitted document online](http://www.itu.int/en/Lists/consultation2015/Attachments/25/Discussion%20on%20Chinese%20IXPs%20Practice-0828.docx) |
| 9. | August 28, 2015 | [Japan Internet Providers Association](http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet/Pages/display-june2015.aspx?ListItemID=26) | [View submitted document online](http://www.itu.int/en/Lists/consultation2015/Attachments/26/ITU-CWG(IXP-2015).rtf) |
| 10. | August 28, 2015 | [Association for Progressive Communications (APC)](http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet/Pages/display-june2015.aspx?ListItemID=29) | Please accept APC's submission for the CWG-Internet Online Open Consultation on IXPs.  [View submitted document online](http://www.itu.int/en/Lists/consultation2015/Attachments/29/APC-IXPs-ITU-CWG-Internet-Submission.pdf) |
| 11. | August 28, 2015 | [Pakistan Telecom Authority](http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet/Pages/display-june2015.aspx?ListItemID=30) | ​In Pakistan some of the operators are peering with each other in major cities of Pakistan and PTCL the incumbent operator has also created Pakistan Internet Exchange PIE, however it does not fulfill the requirement of neutral IXP therefore Pakistan Telecom Authority (PTA) took the initiative in early 2015 to work towards creation of Pakistan Internet Exchange Point. PTA invited all stakeholders from ISPs, mobile phone operators and academia. Pakistan IXP Stakeholder has started work and work has been divided further into five working groups as per detail below:  1. Assessment of establishing IXP and way forward for establishing IXP.  2. Identifying the benefits of IXP, and making recommendations for the respective public/private organizations to achieve these benefits  3. Analyze commercial aspects of small and large ISPs  4. Selection of acceptable venue  5. Relevant data collection through concerned organizations  Generally small ISPs are willing to join IXP, however most of them have lack of trust with incumbent operator, as small ISPs feel that they may lose business and eventually they will be dependent on incumbent operator. To build confidence amongst all ISPs, Pakistan Telecom Authority (PTA) has ensured that neutral multi stakeholder governing body, comprised of Government, ISPs, mobile phone operators and academia will monitor the activities to safeguard the rights of all stakeholders.  Further details are attached in PDF format.  [View submitted document online](http://www.itu.int/en/Lists/consultation2015/Attachments/30/Pakistan%20Response%20on%20IXP.pdf) |
| 12. | August 28, 2015 | [Rwanda Utilities Regulatory Authority](http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet/Pages/display-june2015.aspx?ListItemID=31) | Please find herewith attached Rwanda Contribution to the open consultation.  [View submitted document online](http://www.itu.int/en/Lists/consultation2015/Attachments/31/RWANDA%20CONTRIBUTION%20TO%20CWG-INTERNATIONAL%20INTERNET%20PUBLIC%20POLICY.docx) |
| 13. | August 28, 2015 | [Internet Multifeed Co. (Japan)](http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet/Pages/display-june2015.aspx?ListItemID=32) | ​Internet Exchange Providers in Japan made some comments on ITU Consultation on Best Practices for IXPs. Please refer to the file attached.  [View submitted document online](http://www.itu.int/en/Lists/consultation2015/Attachments/32/20150828-Comments-CWG-Internet-IXP.pdf) |
| 14. | August 28, 2015 | [Internet Exchange Federation (IX-F)](http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet/Pages/display-june2015.aspx?ListItemID=33) | ​Please find attached the submission of the Internet Exchange Federation.  [View submitted document online](http://www.itu.int/en/Lists/consultation2015/Attachments/33/IX-F%20response%20to%20ITU%20consultation%20on%20Best%20Practices%20for%20IXPs%20-%202016-08-28-FINAL.pdf) |
| 15. | August 28, 2015 | [Orange Polska S.A.](http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet/Pages/display-june2015.aspx?ListItemID=35) (Poland) | Please see the attachment.  [View submitted document online](http://www.itu.int/en/Lists/consultation2015/Attachments/35/Contribution%20to%202015%20CWG_final.pdf) |
| 16. | August 28, 2015 | [RIPE NCC](http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet/Pages/display-june2015.aspx?ListItemID=36) | This is a submission on behalf of the RIPE NCC, which serves as Regional Internet Registry for Europe, the Middle East and parts of Central Asia.  [View submitted document online](http://www.itu.int/en/Lists/consultation2015/Attachments/36/RIPE-NCC-IXP-ITU-Aug2015.pdf) |
| 17. | August 28, 2015 | [Comisión Nacional de Telecomunicaciones de Paraguay](http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet/Pages/display-june2015.aspx?ListItemID=37) | En adjunto la contribución de la Comisión Nacional de Telecomunicaciones de la República del Paraguay a esta Consulta.  [View submitted document online](http://www.itu.int/en/Lists/consultation2015/Attachments/37/Paraguay_IXP_GTC-Internet2015.pdf) |
| 18. | August 28, 2015 | [Communications and Information Technology Commission (CITC) of the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia](http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet/Pages/display-june2015.aspx?ListItemID=38) | Attached is CITC input to the CWG-Internet Online Open Consultation.  [View submitted document online](http://www.itu.int/en/Lists/consultation2015/Attachments/38/CITC%20input%20to%20the%20CWG-Internet%20online%20open%20consultation.pdf) |
| 19. | August 28, 2015 | [Internet Society](http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet/Pages/display-june2015.aspx?ListItemID=39) | ​The Internet Society is pleased to contribute to this Open Consultation and thanks the ITU for the opportunity to comment on the critical issue of Internet Exchange Points.  [View submitted document online](http://www.itu.int/en/Lists/consultation2015/Attachments/39/InternetSociety_CWG-Internet-IXP-Stakeholder-Consult%20%2828%20August%29%20FINAL.pdf) |
| 20. | August 28, 2015 | [LACNIC](http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet/Pages/display-june2015.aspx?ListItemID=40) | Comment on Behalf of LACNIC  LACNIC, the Latin American and Caribbean Regional Addresses Registry welcomes the initiative of the ITU to establish this open consultation process as a way of implementing the Tunis Agenda. Taking in consideration the paragraph 69 of the Tunis Agenda, where it is established that multistakeholder cooperation should avoid intervening in “day-to-day technical and operational matters, that do not impact on international public policy issues”, which remains the responsibility of the operators themselves we want to stand out the value of the comments done by the Day to Day operators of IXPs. For the previous reason, LACNIC expresses its support to the comment submitted by the Internet Exchange Federation (IX-F) |
| 21. | August 30, 2015 | [ASDF/EGYPTAIR](http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet/Pages/display-june2015.aspx?ListItemID=41) | The cloud of things technology can addresses all 17 Sustainable Development Goals and holds the promise of fixing the millennium-old human problems of poverty, disease, violence, and poor leadership and Africa and all the world universal adoption of cloud of things Technology that addresses all 17 Sustainable Development Goals AND Africa to be a main consideration in this universal adoption. new technology cloud of things Rising the next engineering that change the idea from love issues and use individuals to enjoy people and use issues, crib tech handle both humanity issue in health and power, assisting aged and disabled people and retains the guarantee of repairing the century-aged individual issues of poverty, illness, assault, and bad management  [View submitted document online (1)](http://www.itu.int/en/Lists/consultation2015/Attachments/41/44.3103.pdf)  [View submitted document online (2)](http://www.itu.int/en/Lists/consultation2015/Attachments/41/45.3104.pdf) |
| 22. | August 31, 2015 | [Ministry of Transport, Information Technology and Communications of the Republic of Bulgaria](http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet/Pages/display-june2015.aspx?ListItemID=42) | Dear Madam/Sir, Please find attached the Contribution by the Republic of Bulgaria on the ITU CWG-Internet On line Consultation on IXPs:  [View submitted document online](http://www.itu.int/en/Lists/consultation2015/Attachments/42/Contribution%20by%20Bulgaria.doc) |
| 23. | September 01, 2015 | [NAP del Caribe (Dominican Republic)](http://www.itu.int/en/council/cwg-internet/Pages/display-june2015.aspx?ListItemID=43) | NAP del Caribe, Study Case- Successful IXP Initiative in the Dominican Republic- Please view attachment.  [View submitted document online](http://www.itu.int/en/Lists/consultation2015/Attachments/43/CASE%20STUDY-%20NAP%20IXP.pdf) |