# Summary Report ITU Workshop on WCIT-12 and WTSA-12DurbanSouth Africa, 10-11 July 2013

Full information on the workshop, including the program and the presentations made, is available at: <http://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/Workshops-and-Seminars/atu-itu/201307/Pages/programme.aspx>

### Day 1: 10 July WCIT Debriefing

**Opening ceremony**

The meeting was moderated by Mr. Jim Paterson, Director, Dept. of Communications, South Africa.

Mr. **Gift Buthelezi**, Deputy Director General, Department of Communications, South Africa, delivered the keynote remarks in which he reflected on how effective and united African countries were as a region in difficult negotiations at WCIT. He appreciated that many African countries were active in leading in the debates on specific issues on behalf of Africa. He emphasized that the region must continue to build on this work, and drive forward to attain its goals. Mr. Buthelezi encouraged all of the African Member States to accede to or ratify the new International Telecommunication Regulations.

Mr. Malcolm Johnson, Director, Telecommunication Standardization Bureau, ITU welcomed the delegates and thanked the ATU and the host country for their work in organizing this event. He congratulated the appointment of the new Minister of Communications Yunus Carrim, and thanked the past Minister Dina Pule for the contribution she made to ITU. He explained the event will review the key outcomes of the three important events held in Dubai at the end of last year: the Global Standards Symposium (GSS); the World Telecommunication Standardization Assembly (WTSA); and the World Conference on International Telecommunications (WCIT). He appreciated that African countries showed a great deal of unity at WCIT-12, attesting to the relevance and value of the treaty to developing countries. Growing at very healthy rates, African economies will be at the heart of global economic growth over the coming decades, and the new ITRs establish a sound framework in which to frame policies to enable the continued development and expansion of African ICT networks.

Mr. Abdoulkarim Soumaila, Secretary General, ATU thanked the ATU members for their active participation in all three events and called upon them to take advantage of the benefits of the outcomes of WCIT and WTSA to the Africa region.

**Session A: WCIT outcomes – an overview**

Mr. Preetam Maloor, Strategy and Policy Advisor, General Secretariat, ITU, provided a broad and factual overview of WCIT outcomes. The presentation included highlights of some key facts and figures, major achievements, an overview of each article, and some details on Article 10 (entry into force) and the accession process. Questions raised included clarification on the option of unilateral declarations available to Member States at the time of accession.

Dr. Sherif Guinena, Advisor to the Executive President, National Telecommunication Regulatory Authority (NTRA), Egypt, made a comparative analysis of the Africa Common Proposals made to WCIT-12 and outcomes of WCIT-12. Dr. Guinena provided an overview of the proposals, and highlighted the key discussions, either from the African delegations or other delegations having different views, and how the compromises were reached.

#### Session B: An analysis of the key outcomes of WCIT

Dr. Richard Hill, Consultant, African Telecommunication Union, provided a detailed analysis on some key provisions of the revised ITRs. Dr. Hill noted that while consensus was found on an overwhelming majority of the treaty text, some provisions proved to be controversial, leading to a split in the membership and sharp criticism of selected provisions. His presentation analyzed that criticism and attempted to place it in context. Dr Hill concluded that the criticism is not justified from the legal point of view so there should be no legal obstacles to accession.

#### Session C: Impact of the new ITRs and WCIT-12 Resolutions on Africa’s interests

This session addressed the potential impact of the new ITRs and WCIT-12 Resolutions on Africa’s interests. The objective of this session was to extract the key issues embedded in the new ITRs and WCIT-12 Resolutions, and to elaborate on how these could have an impact on the future of International Telecommunications.

The three speakers in this session, representing their respective Member States, presented a regional perspective on key areas covered by the revised ITRs.

Ms. Joséphine Adou Biendjui**,** Agence des Télécommunications de Côte d'Ivoire (ATCI), Côte d'Ivoirenoted that several changes were made to the ITRs that are important for Africa from the financial and economic points of view: Preamble, articles 3.7, 4.4 through 4.7, 6.1, 6.1.1, 6.2, and Resolution 5. In particular, ITU-T Study Group 3 was tasked with studying certain specific issues of great interest to Africa. The WCIT outputs address certain important issues, in particular: loss of revenue, excessively high prices, lack of infrastructure, insufficient competition and transparency, lack of consensual mechanisms for dispute resolution and service provision, fraud, low levels of access to infrastructure and services. Ms. Adou Biendjui also listed possible follow up actions for ITU-T, Member States and operators in the region and encouraged all African to be actively involved in the implementation of the WCIT outcomes.

Dr. Sherif Guinena, Advisor to the Executive President, National Telecommunication Regulatory Authority (NTRA), Egypt summarized the key impacts of the new ITRs for Africa. The presentation presented the main provisions of the approved ITRs, noting that the scope had not changed. It also highlighted the compromises made by Africans so as to facilitate finding consensus. It stressed that the new and revised articles open the door for progress in Africa. It concluded that follow up is vital to make use of the provisions: National Regulations and legislations; Also to mitigate negatives aspects; Implementation of relevant WTSA Resolutions; Implementation/enforcement of ITU-T Recommendations; Participate in ITU-T Recommendations development; Elaborate on Dispute Resolution Mechanisms; and Awareness.

Mr. Jim Paterson**,** Director, Dept. of Communications, South Africa, addressed the topics contained in the preamble (on human rights and access to telecommunication services for all Member States), the new article 6 on security and robustness of networks, and the new article 7 on unsolicited bulk electronic communication. He stressed on the importance of the security provision in providing a global framework for tackling important global issues. He called upon African Member States to chart out a follow-up action plan for implementing the security provisions.

Session D: Proposals on an Action Plan on the Implementation of the Treaty, Time Frames, Responsibilities and Modalities for Collaboration between African Member States

Dr. Sherif Guinena presented a proposal of an action plan for collaborative work between ATU members towards the appropriate implementation of the new ITRs and WCIT-12 Resolutions. The proposal covered issues such as: the ratification of the treaty; how to make use of its positive aspects and how to counteract any shortcomings from the point of view of the African Countries, how Africa can tackle the some of the consequent key issues of the ITRs within the ITU Study Groups and other ITU Fora. The draft plan invokes the creation of a number of working groups which will examine, in detail, how best to implement each clause of the ITRs. Each group will make proposals on how to integrate the various clauses with existing legislation and also propose a framework for cooperation at the regional level.

The meeting adopted a *Durban Action Plan* which is as follows

**The participants of the workshop on the outcomes of WCIT, in adopting an [action plan](http://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/Workshops-and-Seminars/atu-itu/201307/Documents/Sherif%20WCIT%20Action%20Plan%20v1_2.xls), call upon Africa region to:**

* **Be inclusive:** Invite all African Member States, as well as other States, to be party to the revised ITRs, while taking all concerns into account, so that Africa and all other regions can maximize the benefits derived from the treaty
* **Be progressive:** Emerge as a global leader on topics such as making ICTs accessible to people with disability, energy efficiency and managing e-waste
* **Be proactive:** Identify institutional frameworks within our respective countries that would help translate the provisions of the treaty into policy and legislation.
* **Be dedicated:** To contribute actively and proactively to studies and initiatives regarding these matter.
* **Be collaborative:** Among ourselves, and to seek partnerships with interested entities, especially UN agencies such as the ITU.
* **Shape the global agenda:** Project Africa as a symbol of regional cooperation and coordination in global Telecommunications.

### Day 2: 11 July WTSA-12 Debriefing

Mrs. Yang from ITU-TSB firstly gave a brief overview of the WTSA-12 conference and its major outcomes: best attended ever WTSA-12 conference approved ITU-T Study Group structure, nominated ITU-T leadership, adopted one Opinion and 50 new/revised Resolutions, approved 6 new technical Recommendations and 7 revised A-series Recommendations.

**Session A: The Africa Common Proposals to WTSA-12, key discussions and outcome of WTSA-12 on the proposals**

Mr. Raynold Mfungehafrom Tanzania reviewed the African region preparation process toward WTSA-12 and African Common Proposal to WTSA-12 on revising Resolutions 11, 20, 22, 26, 32, 35, 40, 44, 54, 64, 68, 69, 70, 72, 73 and 76, highlighted contributions from Cameron, Cote d’Ivoire, Egypt, Ghana, Sudan Uganda and leading role played by South Africa and Tanzania during WTSA-12. There are 20 ITU-T Chairmen/Vice-Chairmen from Africa region in the new 2013-2016 study period. It concluded that many if not all Africa Common Proposals were adopted by WTSA 12. Africa was united on interests and collaborated well with other regional groups. It urged Administrations African countries to support the appointed Chairs and Vice chairs, recommended to submit written contributions to further work of SGs.

Mrs. Xiaoya Yang from ITU-TSB presented in detail key updates to ITU-T mandate and working method in numerous adopted WTSA-12 Resolutions and revised A-series Recommendations.

Director TSB apologized for the lack of translation of presentations due to severe budgetary constraints. The cost of translating a page in Geneva into the official languages is $1000, but TSB has started using ITU-T Academia members for translation at a fraction of cost and hope to be able to provide more translation in future, including implementation guidelines which will be developed for new Recommendations.

**Session B: Key issues in WTSA-12 Resolutions of special interest to African countries**

**Speakers from ITU-T leadership from African region introduced the key topics of specific interest to African countries, e.g., BSG, C&I, numbering issue, accounting and economic issues and security.**

**Mr. Kwame Baah-Acheamfour, SG12 Chairman presented key updates of Resolution 44 Bridging Standardization Gap, highlighted its instruction out from WTSA-12, introduced relevant ITU-T BSG activities and studies carried out in the recent years, future BSG plan, and recaped the responsibilities to ITU Regional Offices and Member States as per Resolution 44 Bridging the Standardization Gap between Developing and the Developed Countries. To complement the implementation of the broader actions plans on BSG, the responsibilities to Member States in other related Resolutions such as on creating of regional groups and their support, enhancing participation of regulators, operators, academia and other sector members from developing countries are also discussed. It is suggested that standardization issues be considered at sub regional meetings of Member States. He noted that ITU-T has very limited resources, so much so that fellowships are not possible, and so sponsorship for the Bridging Standards Gap fund should be encouraged.**

**Mr. Sherif Guinea, SG2 Chairman, presented African contribution to WTSA-12 on numbering, naming, addressing, and identification issues, in particular Resolutions 20, 29, 60, 61, and 65. He also mentioned Resolution 64 on IPv4/IPv6 Allocation and Transition. He highlighted the updates in the revised Resolutions, which were strengthened so as to better meet the needs of many countries, in particular African countries. He noted that ITU-T study groups 2 and 3 were called upon to further study these issues, in particular their economic impact. He concluded by inviting African Member States to contribute to the work, to report numbering misuse, and to implement the relevant ITU-T Recommendations, in particular regarding misuse and calling line identification.**

**Mr. Isaac Boateng, SG11 Vice-Chair, presented African contribution to WTSA-12 on Resolution 76 Conformance and Interoperability, highlighted the updates in the revised Resolution76, analyzed the impact for African countries and introduced the recent progress made in SG11 which was designated as the lead SG by WTSA-12 on this subject. He proposed that ATU/ITU organize workshops as part of capacity building and awareness; conduct a study to identify actions regarding legal/regulatory frameworks, institutions dealing with conformance assessment, accreditation bodies, laboratories, etc; discuss the issues at a high level within national governments; explore the possibility of establishing test laboratories; encourage participation in SG11 and create a regional group of SG11.**

Ms. Joséphine Adou Biendjui**,** vice-Chairman of SG3, presented the main outcomes of WTSA-12 with respect to financial and economic issues of interest to Africa. Eight Resolution and one Opinoin were adopted that are related to those issues. A revision of Recommendation ITU-T D.195 was also approved. The Resolutions in question are 29, 44, 52, 54, 61, 62, 64 and 65. The Opinion is Opinion 1 on implementation of Recommendation D.156 on network externalities. She noted that some of the Resolutions address the issue of operator revenue loss due to misue of numbering or failure to transmit calling line identification. Others address the issue of excessive costs induced by spam, etc. The issue of dispute resolution is also addressed as is IP address allocation and the transistion to IPv6. Implementation of these Resolutions will benefit Africa, so African Member States and Sector Members should contribute to the work of SG3; States should adapt their regulations; regulators should follow up with operators; operators should implement the resolutions and recommendations and provide feedbak to regulators. In summary, WTSA-12 outcomes are important for Africa and take into account most of the African proposals. It is important to follow up on those outcomes.

M**r. Martin Euchner, SG17 Advisor, submitted a presentation on security related Resolutions revised by WTSA-12, e.g., Resolution 50 Cybersecurity, 52 Combating and Countering Spam, 58 CIRTs and introduced relevant activities and studies carried out in SG17 in the recent years, SG17’s future action plan to implement these Resolutions and latest progress made in the recent SG17 meeting held in April 2013.**

**Session C: Proposals on an Action Plan for the implementation of relevant WTSA-12 Resolutions that may have impact on the interests of Africa**

Dr. Sherif Guinena presented a proposal of a draft [action plan](http://www.itu.int/en/ITU-T/Workshops-and-Seminars/atu-itu/201307/Documents/WTSA%20Action%20Plan%20v1_2.xlsx)for collaborative work between ATU members towards the implementation of WTSA-12 Resolutions. The proposal includes prioritized action items on following subjects: environment, naming issue, security, Bridging Standardization Gap, internet, cooperation, technical thematic issues and ITU-T rules and procedures.

**Session D: Wrap up and closing**

The participants thanked the host country, ATU, and ITU for organizing this event, and the speakers for their valuable contributions. The organizing team thanked the participants, the speakers, and the interpreters.